RAYMOND
SMULLYAN
GOD'S
NATURE

1
00:00:05,269 --> 00:00:02,389
raymond smallian was a mathematician a

2
00:00:07,349 --> 00:00:05,279
concert pianist a logician a taoist a

3
00:00:09,110 --> 00:00:07,359
magician and a philosopher there are two

4
00:00:11,589 --> 00:00:09,120
people i desperately would like to have

5
00:00:13,190 --> 00:00:11,599
on the show one is douglas hofstetter

6
00:00:15,270 --> 00:00:13,200
and the other is raymond smallian

7
00:00:17,510 --> 00:00:15,280
unfortunately raymond is no longer with

8
00:00:19,670 --> 00:00:17,520
us at least not in his corporeal form

9
00:00:21,109 --> 00:00:19,680
however his writings remain click on the

10
00:00:23,029 --> 00:00:21,119
timestamp in the description if you'd

11
00:00:24,870 --> 00:00:23,039
like to skip this intro for those new to

12
00:00:26,470 --> 00:00:24,880
this channel my name is kurt jaimungle

13
00:00:28,550 --> 00:00:26,480

i'm a filmmaker with a background in

14
00:00:30,710 --> 00:00:28,560
mathematical physics dedicated to the

15
00:00:33,110 --> 00:00:30,720
explication of what are called theories

16
00:00:35,110 --> 00:00:33,120
of everything from a theoretical physics

17
00:00:36,950 --> 00:00:35,120
perspective but as well as delineating

18
00:00:39,030 --> 00:00:36,960
the possible connection consciousness

19
00:00:41,190 --> 00:00:39,040
has to the fundamental laws of nature

20
00:00:43,350 --> 00:00:41,200
provided these laws exist at all and are

21
00:00:45,029 --> 00:00:43,360
even knowable to us what raven smallian

22
00:00:47,830 --> 00:00:45,039
writes about that's of interest to this

23
00:00:49,990 --> 00:00:47,840
channel is rationality god and free will

24
00:00:51,910 --> 00:00:50,000
raymond's cousin jacob smallian reached

25
00:00:53,590 --> 00:00:51,920
out to me to give me his blessing as the

26
00:00:55,830 --> 00:00:53,600
copyright holder to bring you this

27
00:00:58,069 --> 00:00:55,840
excerpt from the tao is silent published

28
00:01:00,069 --> 00:00:58,079
by harper collins in the u.s this is a

29
00:01:02,229 --> 00:01:00,079
conversation between immortal which i'm

30
00:01:04,469 --> 00:01:02,239
going to be calling man and god on the

31
00:01:06,950 --> 00:01:04,479
burden of free will what it means to be

32
00:01:09,429 --> 00:01:06,960
identified with god and what the laws of

33
00:01:11,830 --> 00:01:09,439
nature mean it evokes the same feelings

34
00:01:13,990 --> 00:01:11,840
of playful awe on the most profound

35
00:01:16,149 --> 00:01:14,000
aspects of life that girdle esherbach

36
00:01:18,710 --> 00:01:16,159
elicits now that's one heck of an

37
00:01:20,710 --> 00:01:18,720
achievement so i'd like to dedicate this

38
00:01:22,390 --> 00:01:20,720

episode to raymond smalian thank you for

39
00:01:24,950 --> 00:01:22,400
what you've done man if you enjoy

40
00:01:26,950 --> 00:01:24,960
witnessing and engaging in conversation

41
00:01:28,950 --> 00:01:26,960
on the topics of psychology physics

42
00:01:30,390 --> 00:01:28,960
consciousness and so on then check the

43
00:01:32,390 --> 00:01:30,400
description for an invitation to the

44
00:01:33,990 --> 00:01:32,400
discord and the theories of everything

45
00:01:36,789 --> 00:01:34,000
subreddit there's also a link to the

46
00:01:38,830 --> 00:01:36,799
patreon that is patreon.com

47
00:01:40,710 --> 00:01:38,840
c-u-r-t

48
00:01:42,550 --> 00:01:40,720
j-a-i-m-u-n-g-a-l kercher mungle if

49
00:01:44,310 --> 00:01:42,560
you'd like to support this podcast as

50
00:01:45,749 --> 00:01:44,320
the patrons and the sponsors are the

51
00:01:47,670 --> 00:01:45,759
only reason i'm able to do this

52
00:01:50,310 --> 00:01:47,680
full-time it would be near impossible at

53
00:01:52,389 --> 00:01:50,320
least for me to have conversations on

54
00:01:54,870 --> 00:01:52,399
loop quantum gravity non-dualism

55
00:01:56,789 --> 00:01:54,880
consciousness even geometric unity with

56
00:01:59,310 --> 00:01:56,799
any sort of fidelity if not for your

57
00:02:00,870 --> 00:01:59,320
support thank you and that link again is

58
00:02:03,030 --> 00:02:00,880
patreon.com

59
00:02:04,950 --> 00:02:03,040
kurtjmungle with regard to sponsors

60
00:02:06,950 --> 00:02:04,960
there are two algo is an end-to-end

61
00:02:08,550 --> 00:02:06,960
supply chain optimization software

62
00:02:10,309 --> 00:02:08,560
company with software that helps

63
00:02:12,470 --> 00:02:10,319

business users optimize sales and

64
00:02:14,710 --> 00:02:12,480
operations planning to avoid stockouts

65
00:02:17,110 --> 00:02:14,720
reduce returns and inventory write downs

66
00:02:19,990 --> 00:02:17,120
while reducing inventory investment it's

67
00:02:21,990 --> 00:02:20,000
a supply chain ai that drives smart roi

68
00:02:24,390 --> 00:02:22,000
headed by a bright individual by the

69
00:02:26,949 --> 00:02:24,400
name of amjad hussein who's been a huge

70
00:02:28,949 --> 00:02:26,959
supporter of this podcast since near its

71
00:02:31,350 --> 00:02:28,959
inception the second sponsor is

72
00:02:33,589 --> 00:02:31,360
brilliant brilliant illuminates the soul

73
00:02:35,270 --> 00:02:33,599
of mathematics science and engineering

74
00:02:37,509 --> 00:02:35,280
through bite-sized interactive learning

75
00:02:39,509 --> 00:02:37,519
experiences that explore the laws that

76
00:02:41,430 --> 00:02:39,519
shape our world it elevates math and

77
00:02:43,430 --> 00:02:41,440
science from something to be feared to a

78
00:02:45,509 --> 00:02:43,440
delightful experience of guided

79
00:02:47,190 --> 00:02:45,519
discovery you can even learn group

80
00:02:48,949 --> 00:02:47,200
theory which is what's being referenced

81
00:02:52,710 --> 00:02:48,959
when people say that the standard model

82
00:02:54,710 --> 00:02:52,720
is based upon u1 cross su-2 cross s23

83
00:02:56,550 --> 00:02:54,720
those are technically called lead groups

84
00:02:59,430 --> 00:02:56,560
visit brilliant.org

85
00:03:01,430 --> 00:02:59,440
toe t-o-e for free and get 20 off the

86
00:03:03,350 --> 00:03:01,440
annual subscription i recommend that you

87
00:03:05,110 --> 00:03:03,360
don't stop before four lessons and i

88
00:03:06,869 --> 00:03:05,120

think you'll be greatly surprised at the

89
00:03:08,390 --> 00:03:06,879
ease at which you can now comprehend

90
00:03:10,869 --> 00:03:08,400
subjects that you previously had

91
00:03:13,910 --> 00:03:10,879
difficulty grocking thank you and enjoy

92
00:03:16,390 --> 00:03:13,920
this excerpt called god is a taoist by

93
00:03:18,390 --> 00:03:16,400
raymond smallian i'll do my best to

94
00:03:19,910 --> 00:03:18,400
preface my commentary with the word

95
00:03:22,710 --> 00:03:19,920
commentary because if you're viewing

96
00:03:24,869 --> 00:03:22,720
this on youtube it's probably obvious

97
00:03:26,550 --> 00:03:24,879
when i'm commenting just based on my

98
00:03:27,990 --> 00:03:26,560
body language and intonation but i

99
00:03:30,309 --> 00:03:28,000
realize that it's equivocal for those

100
00:03:32,149 --> 00:03:30,319
who are on the audio platforms i also

101
00:03:33,750 --> 00:03:32,159
know that the word taoist is pronounced

102
00:03:35,430 --> 00:03:33,760
taoist

103
00:03:37,509 --> 00:03:35,440
but for whatever reason that feels

104
00:03:40,789 --> 00:03:37,519
disingenuous to me saying it it feels

105
00:03:44,070 --> 00:03:40,799
affected on my part let's get to it

106
00:03:47,190 --> 00:03:44,080
man says and therefore oh god i pray

107
00:03:49,750 --> 00:03:47,200
thee if thou has one ounce of mercy for

108
00:03:51,670 --> 00:03:49,760
this thy suffering creature absolve me

109
00:03:54,550 --> 00:03:51,680
of having to have free will

110
00:03:55,830 --> 00:03:54,560
god says you reject the greatest gift

111
00:03:58,149 --> 00:03:55,840
i've given thee

112
00:04:00,869 --> 00:03:58,159
man how can i call that which has been

113
00:04:02,550 --> 00:04:00,879

forced onto me a gift i have free will

114
00:04:05,030 --> 00:04:02,560
but not of my own free will not of my

115
00:04:07,589 --> 00:04:05,040
own choice i have never thus freely

116
00:04:10,869 --> 00:04:07,599
chosen to have free will i have to have

117
00:04:13,270 --> 00:04:10,879
free will whether i like it or not

118
00:04:16,229 --> 00:04:13,280
god why would you wish to not have free

119
00:04:18,710 --> 00:04:16,239
will man because free will means moral

120
00:04:21,830 --> 00:04:18,720
responsibility and moral responsibility

121
00:04:23,749 --> 00:04:21,840
is more than i can bear commentary

122
00:04:24,950 --> 00:04:23,759
some people are burdened by guilt guilt

123
00:04:25,830 --> 00:04:24,960
that they haven't achieved what they

124
00:04:27,909 --> 00:04:25,840
should

125
00:04:29,030 --> 00:04:27,919
guilt that they've done horrible acts in

126
00:04:31,430 --> 00:04:29,040
the past that they think they shouldn't

127
00:04:32,629 --> 00:04:31,440
have now one solution is when this comes

128
00:04:35,110 --> 00:04:32,639
from the eastern end the more

129
00:04:37,189 --> 00:04:35,120
non-duelist and is that well we

130
00:04:38,710 --> 00:04:37,199
eradicate free will that is tell someone

131
00:04:40,629 --> 00:04:38,720
there exists no free will and then they

132
00:04:42,469 --> 00:04:40,639
couldn't have done otherwise and another

133
00:04:44,310 --> 00:04:42,479
route is to eradicate morality

134
00:04:46,310 --> 00:04:44,320
altogether because implicit in what i've

135
00:04:48,310 --> 00:04:46,320
said before or somewhat explicit is the

136
00:04:49,990 --> 00:04:48,320
word should while some of those on the

137
00:04:52,070 --> 00:04:50,000
more eastern end will criticize the

138
00:04:53,749 --> 00:04:52,080

western end by saying you want to

139
00:04:55,830 --> 00:04:53,759
preserve free will because you have an

140
00:04:57,670 --> 00:04:55,840
ego and your ego wants to say for

141
00:04:59,430 --> 00:04:57,680
example that you're responsible for the

142
00:05:01,189 --> 00:04:59,440
successful position in life that you're

143
00:05:03,189 --> 00:05:01,199
in you'll want to bolster your

144
00:05:05,189 --> 00:05:03,199
self-image and minimize the role of

145
00:05:06,950 --> 00:05:05,199
happenstance however there's the twin

146
00:05:09,029 --> 00:05:06,960
motivation on the other side of not

147
00:05:10,469 --> 00:05:09,039
wanting to feel the crushing weight of

148
00:05:12,310 --> 00:05:10,479
free will

149
00:05:14,710 --> 00:05:12,320
so it's not as if one side is immune

150
00:05:17,350 --> 00:05:14,720
from ulterior motives perhaps your life

151
00:05:20,070 --> 00:05:17,360
is so hard so terrible so crushing in

152
00:05:21,909 --> 00:05:20,080
terms of the weight of free will and so

153
00:05:23,830 --> 00:05:21,919
on that you have an unconscious

154
00:05:24,870 --> 00:05:23,840
motivation to believe that there doesn't

155
00:05:27,110 --> 00:05:24,880
exist it

156
00:05:29,350 --> 00:05:27,120
back to the dialogue

157
00:05:32,070 --> 00:05:29,360
god why do you find moral responsibility

158
00:05:34,310 --> 00:05:32,080
so unbearable man why i honestly can't

159
00:05:36,629 --> 00:05:34,320
analyze why all i know is that i do god

160
00:05:38,870 --> 00:05:36,639
all right in that case i absolve you of

161
00:05:40,790 --> 00:05:38,880
all your moral responsibility but leave

162
00:05:43,909 --> 00:05:40,800
you still with having free will so will

163
00:05:46,550 --> 00:05:43,919

this be satisfactory man no i'm afraid

164
00:05:47,830 --> 00:05:46,560
not he says after a pause

165
00:05:50,070 --> 00:05:47,840
god says

166
00:05:52,230 --> 00:05:50,080
ah just as i thought so moral

167
00:05:55,110 --> 00:05:52,240
responsibility isn't the only aspect of

168
00:05:57,110 --> 00:05:55,120
free will that you object to

169
00:05:59,110 --> 00:05:57,120
what else is it about free will that's

170
00:06:01,270 --> 00:05:59,120
bothering you man

171
00:06:02,790 --> 00:06:01,280
with free will i'm capable of sinning

172
00:06:04,710 --> 00:06:02,800
and i don't want to sin

173
00:06:07,110 --> 00:06:04,720
god if you don't want to sin then why do

174
00:06:09,510 --> 00:06:07,120
you man good god i don't know why i want

175
00:06:12,150 --> 00:06:09,520
to sin i just do evil temptations come

176
00:06:13,590 --> 00:06:12,160
along and try as i can i cannot resist

177
00:06:16,309 --> 00:06:13,600
them

178
00:06:18,150 --> 00:06:16,319
god okay well if it's true you can't

179
00:06:19,990 --> 00:06:18,160
resist them then you're not sinning of

180
00:06:23,670 --> 00:06:20,000
your own free will and hence according

181
00:06:24,629 --> 00:06:23,680
to me at least that's not sinning at all

182
00:06:27,990 --> 00:06:24,639
man

183
00:06:30,309 --> 00:06:28,000
no no i keep feeling that if only i

184
00:06:33,110 --> 00:06:30,319
tried harder i could avoid sinning i

185
00:06:35,749 --> 00:06:33,120
understand that the will is infinite

186
00:06:38,390 --> 00:06:35,759
if one wholeheartedly wills not to sin

187
00:06:39,350 --> 00:06:38,400
then one won't sin

188
00:06:41,590 --> 00:06:39,360

god

189
00:06:43,189 --> 00:06:41,600
well now you should know do you try as

190
00:06:44,950 --> 00:06:43,199
hard as you can to avoid sinning or

191
00:06:47,029 --> 00:06:44,960
don't you

192
00:06:48,710 --> 00:06:47,039
i honestly don't know at the time i feel

193
00:06:51,029 --> 00:06:48,720
like i'm trying as hard as i can but in

194
00:06:52,070 --> 00:06:51,039
retrospect i'm worried that i maybe

195
00:06:53,830 --> 00:06:52,080
didn't

196
00:06:55,589 --> 00:06:53,840
god so in other words you don't know

197
00:06:57,029 --> 00:06:55,599
whether or not you've been sinning the

198
00:07:00,070 --> 00:06:57,039
possibility is open that you haven't

199
00:07:02,870 --> 00:07:00,080
been sinning at all man of course the

200
00:07:04,629 --> 00:07:02,880
possibility is open but maybe i have

201
00:07:07,670 --> 00:07:04,639
been sinning and this thought is what so

202
00:07:10,469 --> 00:07:08,550
god

203
00:07:13,909 --> 00:07:10,479
why does the thought of sinning frighten

204
00:07:15,589 --> 00:07:13,919
you man i don't know why for one you do

205
00:07:17,749 --> 00:07:15,599
have a reputation for medding out rather

206
00:07:18,790 --> 00:07:17,759
gruesome punishments in the afterlife

207
00:07:20,390 --> 00:07:18,800
god

208
00:07:21,749 --> 00:07:20,400
okay so that's what's bothering you why

209
00:07:23,830 --> 00:07:21,759
didn't you say so in the first place

210
00:07:25,990 --> 00:07:23,840
with all this peripheral talk of free

211
00:07:28,230 --> 00:07:26,000
will and responsibility why didn't you

212
00:07:29,430 --> 00:07:28,240
simply request to me to not punish you

213
00:07:31,589 --> 00:07:29,440

for your sins

214
00:07:32,870 --> 00:07:31,599
man well i'm realistic enough to know

215
00:07:35,510 --> 00:07:32,880
that you would hardly grant such a

216
00:07:37,749 --> 00:07:35,520
request god you don't say you have a

217
00:07:39,029 --> 00:07:37,759
realistic knowledge of what requests i

218
00:07:40,550 --> 00:07:39,039
grant eh

219
00:07:42,469 --> 00:07:40,560
it's canadian

220
00:07:44,710 --> 00:07:42,479
well i'll tell you what i'm going to do

221
00:07:47,670 --> 00:07:44,720
i'm going to grant you a very very

222
00:07:49,909 --> 00:07:47,680
special dispensation to sin as much as

223
00:07:51,830 --> 00:07:49,919
you like and i will give you my divine

224
00:07:54,230 --> 00:07:51,840
word of honor that i will never punish

225
00:07:57,350 --> 00:07:54,240
you in the least agreed

226
00:07:58,710 --> 00:07:57,360
man in great terror no no no no don't do

227
00:08:01,270 --> 00:07:58,720
that god

228
00:08:03,350 --> 00:08:01,280
why not don't you trust my divine word

229
00:08:05,830 --> 00:08:03,360
man of course i do but don't you see i

230
00:08:08,469 --> 00:08:05,840
don't want to sin i have an utter

231
00:08:11,270 --> 00:08:08,479
abhorrence of sinning quite apart from

232
00:08:13,670 --> 00:08:11,280
any punishments it may entail god in

233
00:08:16,790 --> 00:08:13,680
that case i'll do you one better i'll

234
00:08:19,110 --> 00:08:16,800
remove your abhorrence of sinning

235
00:08:21,189 --> 00:08:19,120
here is a magic pill just swallow it and

236
00:08:23,430 --> 00:08:21,199
you'll lose all abhorrence of sinning

237
00:08:25,510 --> 00:08:23,440
you will joyfully and merely sin away

238
00:08:27,749 --> 00:08:25,520

you will have no regrets no abhorrence

239
00:08:29,350 --> 00:08:27,759
and i still promise you will never be

240
00:08:33,589 --> 00:08:29,360
punished by me

241
00:08:36,230 --> 00:08:33,599
or yourself or by any source whatsoever

242
00:08:39,909 --> 00:08:36,240
you will be blissful for all eternity so

243
00:08:43,190 --> 00:08:39,919
here it is here is the pill man no no

244
00:08:45,190 --> 00:08:43,200
god are you not being irrational i am

245
00:08:48,710 --> 00:08:45,200
even removing your abhorrence of sin

246
00:08:53,750 --> 00:08:51,750
man i still won't take it god why not

247
00:08:56,389 --> 00:08:53,760
man i believe that the pill will indeed

248
00:08:58,470 --> 00:08:56,399
remove my future abhorrence of sinning

249
00:09:00,870 --> 00:08:58,480
but my present abhorrence is enough to

250
00:09:04,150 --> 00:09:00,880
prevent me from being willing to take it

251
00:09:05,350 --> 00:09:04,160
god i command you to take it man i

252
00:09:06,790 --> 00:09:05,360
refuse

253
00:09:10,070 --> 00:09:06,800
god

254
00:09:12,230 --> 00:09:10,080
you refuse of your own free will man yes

255
00:09:14,790 --> 00:09:12,240
ah god says so it seems that your free

256
00:09:17,190 --> 00:09:14,800
will comes in pretty handy doesn't it

257
00:09:18,949 --> 00:09:17,200
man i don't understand god aren't you

258
00:09:22,150 --> 00:09:18,959
glad now that you have the free will to

259
00:09:23,990 --> 00:09:22,160
refuse such a ghastly offer how would

260
00:09:26,870 --> 00:09:24,000
you like it if i forced you to take this

261
00:09:29,350 --> 00:09:26,880
pill whether you wanted it or not

262
00:09:31,190 --> 00:09:29,360
commentary see it's unclear what free

263
00:09:33,829 --> 00:09:31,200

will is defined as some people would say

264
00:09:35,430 --> 00:09:33,839
it's if you go backward in time which we

265
00:09:37,430 --> 00:09:35,440
have to presume that's even possible you

266
00:09:38,870 --> 00:09:37,440
could have done differently

267
00:09:40,550 --> 00:09:38,880
it seems like the more you analyze the

268
00:09:42,310 --> 00:09:40,560
definition of free will the more that it

269
00:09:44,230 --> 00:09:42,320
slips through your fingers however

270
00:09:46,230 --> 00:09:44,240
that's true of many of the most

271
00:09:47,190 --> 00:09:46,240
significant aspects of our lives and it

272
00:09:48,870 --> 00:09:47,200
doesn't mean that we shouldn't

273
00:09:50,710 --> 00:09:48,880
investigate it same with consciousness

274
00:09:52,389 --> 00:09:50,720
the more one talks about consciousness

275
00:09:53,590 --> 00:09:52,399
the more one seems to describe it in

276
00:09:55,509 --> 00:09:53,600
words that are synonyms with

277
00:09:57,269 --> 00:09:55,519
consciousness like experience or

278
00:09:59,190 --> 00:09:57,279
awareness but that to me doesn't mean

279
00:10:01,590 --> 00:09:59,200
that we shouldn't continue to dialogue

280
00:10:04,150 --> 00:10:01,600
about it for example for many years the

281
00:10:06,630 --> 00:10:04,160
word energy the word length and speed

282
00:10:09,190 --> 00:10:06,640
and so on didn't have exact precise

283
00:10:11,030 --> 00:10:09,200
definitions it wasn't until physics

284
00:10:12,710 --> 00:10:11,040
came about or the rudiments of physics

285
00:10:14,790 --> 00:10:12,720
however all of this preliminary

286
00:10:16,230 --> 00:10:14,800
conversation with these indistinct words

287
00:10:18,230 --> 00:10:16,240
are what led to the words becoming

288
00:10:20,150 --> 00:10:18,240

distinct later it's not as if physics

289
00:10:22,069 --> 00:10:20,160
emerged from a vacuum now you may say

290
00:10:23,750 --> 00:10:22,079
that well physics came about once

291
00:10:25,670 --> 00:10:23,760
rationality was applied however

292
00:10:27,350 --> 00:10:25,680
rationality didn't emerge from a vacuum

293
00:10:29,670 --> 00:10:27,360
either on a recent conversation with

294
00:10:31,750 --> 00:10:29,680
jonathan blow on this channel he

295
00:10:34,069 --> 00:10:31,760
indicates that the word free will is

296
00:10:35,990 --> 00:10:34,079
somewhat meaningless i don't think so i

297
00:10:37,670 --> 00:10:36,000
think it may be meaningless currently

298
00:10:40,710 --> 00:10:37,680
but i don't think talking about it is

299
00:10:45,269 --> 00:10:42,790
man no no no please don't feed me this

300
00:10:47,110 --> 00:10:45,279
pill god of course i won't i'm just

301
00:10:48,870 --> 00:10:47,120
trying to illustrate a point

302
00:10:51,190 --> 00:10:48,880
all right let me put it this way instead

303
00:10:53,590 --> 00:10:51,200
of forcing you to take this pill suppose

304
00:10:54,949 --> 00:10:53,600
i grant your original prayer of removing

305
00:10:56,790 --> 00:10:54,959
your free will but with the

306
00:10:58,470 --> 00:10:56,800
understanding that the moment you are no

307
00:11:03,590 --> 00:10:58,480
longer free

308
00:11:06,470 --> 00:11:04,470
man

309
00:11:09,269 --> 00:11:06,480
once my will is gone how can i possibly

310
00:11:11,030 --> 00:11:09,279
choose to take the pill god i didn't say

311
00:11:13,750 --> 00:11:11,040
you would choose it i merely said you

312
00:11:16,470 --> 00:11:13,760
would take it you would act let us say

313
00:11:18,870 --> 00:11:16,480

according to purely deterministic laws

314
00:11:21,590 --> 00:11:18,880
which are such that you would as a

315
00:11:23,509 --> 00:11:21,600
matter of fact take it

316
00:11:25,910 --> 00:11:23,519
man i still refuse

317
00:11:28,150 --> 00:11:25,920
god so you refuse my offer to remove

318
00:11:30,550 --> 00:11:28,160
your free will this is rather different

319
00:11:33,190 --> 00:11:30,560
from your original prayer isn't it

320
00:11:35,750 --> 00:11:33,200
man now i see what you're up to your

321
00:11:37,590 --> 00:11:35,760
argument is ingenious but i'm not sure

322
00:11:39,750 --> 00:11:37,600
it's really correct there are some

323
00:11:40,829 --> 00:11:39,760
points that we have to go over again god

324
00:11:43,269 --> 00:11:40,839
certainly

325
00:11:45,670 --> 00:11:43,279
man there are two things you said which

326
00:11:48,230 --> 00:11:45,680
seem contradictory to me first you said

327
00:11:50,389 --> 00:11:48,240
that one cannot sin unless one does so

328
00:11:51,750 --> 00:11:50,399
of one's own free will but then you said

329
00:11:54,389 --> 00:11:51,760
you can give me a pill that would

330
00:11:57,269 --> 00:11:54,399
deprive me of my free will and then i

331
00:11:59,509 --> 00:11:57,279
could sin as much as i like however if i

332
00:12:01,190 --> 00:11:59,519
had no free will according to your first

333
00:12:04,389 --> 00:12:01,200
statement how could i possibly be

334
00:12:06,870 --> 00:12:04,399
capable of sinning

335
00:12:08,629 --> 00:12:06,880
god you are confusing two separate parts

336
00:12:10,949 --> 00:12:08,639
of our conversation i never said the

337
00:12:12,310 --> 00:12:10,959
pill would deprive you of free will but

338
00:12:14,550 --> 00:12:12,320

only that it would remove your

339
00:12:15,910 --> 00:12:14,560
abhorrence of sinning

340
00:12:18,870 --> 00:12:15,920
man

341
00:12:21,430 --> 00:12:18,880
i'm a bit confused god all right then

342
00:12:23,990 --> 00:12:21,440
let's make a fresh start suppose i agree

343
00:12:25,590 --> 00:12:24,000
to remove your free will

344
00:12:27,750 --> 00:12:25,600
but with the understanding that you will

345
00:12:29,750 --> 00:12:27,760
then commit an enormous number of acts

346
00:12:31,509 --> 00:12:29,760
which you now regard as sinful

347
00:12:34,069 --> 00:12:31,519
technically speaking you will not then

348
00:12:36,230 --> 00:12:34,079
be sinning since you will not be doing

349
00:12:38,710 --> 00:12:36,240
these acts of your own free will and

350
00:12:41,910 --> 00:12:38,720
these acts carry no moral responsibility

351
00:12:44,470 --> 00:12:41,920
no moral culpability nor any punishment

352
00:12:46,230 --> 00:12:44,480
whatsoever nevertheless these acts will

353
00:12:48,470 --> 00:12:46,240
all be of the type which you presently

354
00:12:50,389 --> 00:12:48,480
regard as sinful they will all have this

355
00:12:52,389 --> 00:12:50,399
quality which you presently feel as

356
00:12:53,990 --> 00:12:52,399
abhorrent but your abhorrence will

357
00:12:56,150 --> 00:12:54,000
disappear

358
00:12:58,790 --> 00:12:56,160
so you will not then feel abhorrent

359
00:13:01,350 --> 00:12:58,800
toward the act man no but i have a

360
00:13:03,190 --> 00:13:01,360
present abhorrence toward the acts and

361
00:13:05,110 --> 00:13:03,200
this present abhorrence is sufficient to

362
00:13:08,069 --> 00:13:05,120
prevent me from accepting your proposal

363
00:13:10,150 --> 00:13:08,079

god god says hmm okay let me get this

364
00:13:11,910 --> 00:13:10,160
absolutely straight i take it you no

365
00:13:15,590 --> 00:13:11,920
longer wish for me to remove your free

366
00:13:17,829 --> 00:13:15,600
will man reluctantly says no i guess not

367
00:13:20,550 --> 00:13:17,839
god all right i agree not to but i'm

368
00:13:22,310 --> 00:13:20,560
still not exactly clear as to why you no

369
00:13:25,829 --> 00:13:22,320
longer wish to get rid of your free will

370
00:13:28,069 --> 00:13:25,839
so please tell me again man because as

371
00:13:30,389 --> 00:13:28,079
you've told me without free will i would

372
00:13:31,670 --> 00:13:30,399
sin even more than i do now

373
00:13:33,269 --> 00:13:31,680
god

374
00:13:35,269 --> 00:13:33,279
but i've already told you that without

375
00:13:36,310 --> 00:13:35,279
free will you cannot sin

376
00:13:38,069 --> 00:13:36,320
man

377
00:13:40,310 --> 00:13:38,079
but if i choose now to get rid of my

378
00:13:42,230 --> 00:13:40,320
free will then all my subsequent evil

379
00:13:44,310 --> 00:13:42,240
actions will not be sins not of the

380
00:13:46,949 --> 00:13:44,320
future but of the present moment in

381
00:13:48,710 --> 00:13:46,959
which i choose not to have free will god

382
00:13:49,750 --> 00:13:48,720
sounds like you're pretty badly trapped

383
00:13:51,829 --> 00:13:49,760
doesn't it

384
00:13:53,990 --> 00:13:51,839
man of course i'm trapped you've placed

385
00:13:56,790 --> 00:13:54,000
this hideous double blind on me now

386
00:13:59,110 --> 00:13:56,800
whatever i do is wrong if i retain free

387
00:14:01,509 --> 00:13:59,120
will i will continue to sin if i abandon

388
00:14:04,310 --> 00:14:01,519

my free will with your help of course i

389
00:14:05,430 --> 00:14:04,320
will now be sinning in doing so

390
00:14:08,230 --> 00:14:05,440
god

391
00:14:10,470 --> 00:14:08,240
but by the same token you place me in a

392
00:14:12,790 --> 00:14:10,480
double bind i am willing to leave you

393
00:14:15,030 --> 00:14:12,800
with free will or to remove it as you

394
00:14:17,110 --> 00:14:15,040
choose but neither alternative satisfies

395
00:14:20,710 --> 00:14:17,120
you i wish to help you but it seems like

396
00:14:24,230 --> 00:14:20,720
i cannot man true god but since it's not

397
00:14:25,750 --> 00:14:24,240
my fault why are you still angry with me

398
00:14:27,350 --> 00:14:25,760
man

399
00:14:31,269 --> 00:14:27,360
for having placed me in such a horrible

400
00:14:34,389 --> 00:14:31,279
predicament in the first place

401
00:14:38,550 --> 00:14:36,550
in the video that i have with leo gura i

402
00:14:40,470 --> 00:14:38,560
talk about atheists and how it doesn't

403
00:14:42,870 --> 00:14:40,480
seem like atheists disbelieve in god

404
00:14:45,189 --> 00:14:42,880
necessarily it seems like they in fact

405
00:14:47,990 --> 00:14:45,199
dislike god or dislike god if god were

406
00:14:50,550 --> 00:14:48,000
to exist because in their mind if god

407
00:14:52,550 --> 00:14:50,560
was to exist what kind of god would

408
00:14:54,870 --> 00:14:52,560
allow the torturing of a child or

409
00:14:56,470 --> 00:14:54,880
animals or the raping of mothers in

410
00:14:58,870 --> 00:14:56,480
front of their children and live

411
00:15:00,949 --> 00:14:58,880
vivisections on

412
00:15:02,550 --> 00:15:00,959
thousands of people if not tens of

413
00:15:04,470 --> 00:15:02,560

thousands if not

414
00:15:08,470 --> 00:15:04,480
worse and worse and worse you can see

415
00:15:13,829 --> 00:15:11,509
in some ways i analogize this to

416
00:15:16,069 --> 00:15:13,839
thinking that one knows better than god

417
00:15:18,389 --> 00:15:16,079
because the problem of evil let's say to

418
00:15:19,670 --> 00:15:18,399
call it the problem of evil implies that

419
00:15:21,670 --> 00:15:19,680
you believe you have a better

420
00:15:23,750 --> 00:15:21,680
understanding of what good is than god

421
00:15:25,590 --> 00:15:23,760
himself it implies that your current

422
00:15:27,670 --> 00:15:25,600
knowledge is sufficient enough for you

423
00:15:29,749 --> 00:15:27,680
to make an authoritative determination

424
00:15:31,110 --> 00:15:29,759
to say what is good and what is evil all

425
00:15:32,949 --> 00:15:31,120
of this is to say while it may be

426
00:15:34,949 --> 00:15:32,959
obvious to many people it's not obvious

427
00:15:38,069 --> 00:15:34,959
to me exactly what the difference is

428
00:15:40,470 --> 00:15:38,079
between disbelieving in god and

429
00:15:42,790 --> 00:15:40,480
despising god

430
00:15:44,550 --> 00:15:42,800
getting back to the conversation

431
00:15:47,030 --> 00:15:44,560
god okay it sounds like you're pretty

432
00:15:48,790 --> 00:15:47,040
badly trapped doesn't it man you've

433
00:15:50,949 --> 00:15:48,800
placed me in this horrible predicament

434
00:15:53,110 --> 00:15:50,959
in the first place god but according to

435
00:15:55,350 --> 00:15:53,120
you there's nothing satisfactory i could

436
00:15:57,590 --> 00:15:55,360
have done man you mean there's nothing

437
00:15:59,990 --> 00:15:57,600
satisfactory you can do now that doesn't

438
00:16:00,949 --> 00:16:00,000

mean there's nothing you could have done

439
00:16:01,829 --> 00:16:00,959
god

440
00:16:03,990 --> 00:16:01,839
why

441
00:16:06,150 --> 00:16:04,000
what could i have done man

442
00:16:08,230 --> 00:16:06,160
obviously you should never have given me

443
00:16:10,870 --> 00:16:08,240
free will in the first place now that

444
00:16:13,670 --> 00:16:10,880
you've given it to me it is too late

445
00:16:15,110 --> 00:16:13,680
anything i do will be bad but you should

446
00:16:15,910 --> 00:16:15,120
never have given it to me in the first

447
00:16:17,110 --> 00:16:15,920
place

448
00:16:18,790 --> 00:16:17,120
god

449
00:16:21,430 --> 00:16:18,800
why would it be better for me to have

450
00:16:23,030 --> 00:16:21,440
never given you free will man because

451
00:16:23,910 --> 00:16:23,040
then i would never have been capable of

452
00:16:25,350 --> 00:16:23,920
sinning

453
00:16:26,710 --> 00:16:25,360
god well

454
00:16:28,790 --> 00:16:26,720
i'm always glad to learn from my

455
00:16:29,670 --> 00:16:28,800
mistakes man what

456
00:16:31,670 --> 00:16:29,680
god

457
00:16:33,590 --> 00:16:31,680
i know that sounds sort of self

458
00:16:35,670 --> 00:16:33,600
blasphemous doesn't it it almost

459
00:16:38,150 --> 00:16:35,680
involves a logical paradox on the one

460
00:16:40,069 --> 00:16:38,160
hand as you've been taught it is morally

461
00:16:42,310 --> 00:16:40,079
wrong for any sentient being to claim

462
00:16:43,990 --> 00:16:42,320
that i am capable of making mistakes on

463
00:16:46,629 --> 00:16:44,000

the other hand i have the right to do

464
00:16:49,670 --> 00:16:46,639
anything but i'm also a sentient being

465
00:16:51,590 --> 00:16:49,680
so the question is do i or do i not have

466
00:16:53,350 --> 00:16:51,600
the right to claim that i'm capable of

467
00:16:55,430 --> 00:16:53,360
making mistakes

468
00:16:57,030 --> 00:16:55,440
commentary there are some philosophers

469
00:16:59,269 --> 00:16:57,040
who think that god is incapable of

470
00:17:01,509 --> 00:16:59,279
making a logical contradiction which

471
00:17:03,509 --> 00:17:01,519
means that logic is imposed upon god

472
00:17:05,189 --> 00:17:03,519
which implies constraints on god that

473
00:17:07,270 --> 00:17:05,199
are not god unless you want to make an

474
00:17:09,429 --> 00:17:07,280
equivalence between god and logic which

475
00:17:10,710 --> 00:17:09,439
some do logos is the root of logic

476
00:17:12,630 --> 00:17:10,720
there's also the school of thought that

477
00:17:14,549 --> 00:17:12,640
it's not blasphemous to think that god

478
00:17:16,710 --> 00:17:14,559
can't do a logical contradiction it's

479
00:17:18,390 --> 00:17:16,720
not as if this is a subtle debate

480
00:17:20,630 --> 00:17:18,400
getting back to the text

481
00:17:23,189 --> 00:17:20,640
man that is a bad joke one of your

482
00:17:25,110 --> 00:17:23,199
premises is simply false i have not been

483
00:17:27,350 --> 00:17:25,120
taught that it is wrong for any sentient

484
00:17:30,150 --> 00:17:27,360
being to doubt your omniscience but only

485
00:17:32,390 --> 00:17:30,160
for a mortal to doubt it

486
00:17:33,990 --> 00:17:32,400
but since you're not mortal

487
00:17:37,190 --> 00:17:34,000
then you're obviously free from this

488
00:17:39,510 --> 00:17:37,200

injunction god good so you realize this

489
00:17:41,909 --> 00:17:39,520
on a rational level nevertheless you did

490
00:17:43,510 --> 00:17:41,919
appear shocked when i said i'm glad to

491
00:17:45,590 --> 00:17:43,520
learn from my mistakes

492
00:17:47,510 --> 00:17:45,600
man of course i was shocked i was

493
00:17:49,830 --> 00:17:47,520
shocked not by yourself blasphemous

494
00:17:51,510 --> 00:17:49,840
behavior as you jokingly called it not

495
00:17:53,590 --> 00:17:51,520
by the fact that you had no right to say

496
00:17:54,950 --> 00:17:53,600
it but just by the fact that you did say

497
00:17:57,270 --> 00:17:54,960
it since i've been taught that as a

498
00:17:59,190 --> 00:17:57,280
matter of fact you don't make mistakes

499
00:18:02,070 --> 00:17:59,200
so i was amazed that you claim it's

500
00:18:04,150 --> 00:18:02,080
possible for you to make mistakes god i

501
00:18:05,830 --> 00:18:04,160
have not claimed that it's possible all

502
00:18:07,669 --> 00:18:05,840
i am saying is that if i were to make

503
00:18:09,430 --> 00:18:07,679
mistakes i will be happy to learn from

504
00:18:13,110 --> 00:18:09,440
them but this says nothing about whether

505
00:18:16,230 --> 00:18:13,120
the if has or ever can be realized

506
00:18:18,390 --> 00:18:16,240
man stop quibbling about this point do

507
00:18:20,630 --> 00:18:18,400
you or do you not admit that it was a

508
00:18:23,029 --> 00:18:20,640
mistake to have given me free will

509
00:18:25,190 --> 00:18:23,039
god well now this is precisely what i

510
00:18:27,430 --> 00:18:25,200
want to propose we should investigate

511
00:18:29,350 --> 00:18:27,440
let me review your present predicament

512
00:18:31,430 --> 00:18:29,360
you don't want to have free will because

513
00:18:33,430 --> 00:18:31,440

with free will you can sin and you don't

514
00:18:35,350 --> 00:18:33,440
want to sin on the other hand if you

515
00:18:37,190 --> 00:18:35,360
agreed to give up free will then you

516
00:18:39,430 --> 00:18:37,200
would now be responsible for the acts of

517
00:18:41,029 --> 00:18:39,440
the future ergo i should never have

518
00:18:43,669 --> 00:18:41,039
given you the free will in the first

519
00:18:45,830 --> 00:18:43,679
place man exactly god i understand

520
00:18:48,070 --> 00:18:45,840
exactly how you feel many mortals even

521
00:18:51,029 --> 00:18:48,080
some theologians have complained that

522
00:18:52,549 --> 00:18:51,039
i've been rather unfair in that it was i

523
00:18:54,390 --> 00:18:52,559
not they who decided that they should

524
00:18:56,390 --> 00:18:54,400
have free will and then hold them

525
00:18:58,150 --> 00:18:56,400
responsible for their actions in other

526
00:19:00,150 --> 00:18:58,160
words they feel that they're expected to

527
00:19:02,549 --> 00:19:00,160
live up to a contract with me which they

528
00:19:05,750 --> 00:19:02,559
never agreed to in the first place man

529
00:19:08,310 --> 00:19:05,760
exactly god as i said i understand the

530
00:19:10,470 --> 00:19:08,320
feeling perfectly and i can appreciate

531
00:19:12,150 --> 00:19:10,480
the justice of the complaint but the

532
00:19:13,990 --> 00:19:12,160
complaints only arise from an

533
00:19:16,390 --> 00:19:14,000
unrealistic understanding of the true

534
00:19:18,630 --> 00:19:16,400
issues involved i am about to enlighten

535
00:19:20,630 --> 00:19:18,640
you as to what these are and i think the

536
00:19:22,549 --> 00:19:20,640
results will surprise you but instead of

537
00:19:24,710 --> 00:19:22,559
telling you outright i shall continue to

538
00:19:26,870 --> 00:19:24,720

use the socratic method

539
00:19:29,110 --> 00:19:26,880
to repeat you regret that i've ever

540
00:19:31,110 --> 00:19:29,120
given you free will i claim that when

541
00:19:33,510 --> 00:19:31,120
you see the true ramifications you will

542
00:19:37,590 --> 00:19:33,520
no longer have this regret to prove my

543
00:19:44,070 --> 00:19:40,230
i am about to create a new universe a

544
00:19:49,029 --> 00:19:46,470
in this new universe you will be born a

545
00:19:51,350 --> 00:19:49,039
man a mortal just like you for all

546
00:19:53,990 --> 00:19:51,360
practical purposes we may say you are

547
00:19:57,029 --> 00:19:54,000
being reborn now i can give this new

548
00:19:58,710 --> 00:19:57,039
mortal this new you free will or not

549
00:20:01,110 --> 00:19:58,720
what would you like me to do

550
00:20:03,909 --> 00:20:01,120
man in great relief says okay please

551
00:20:04,789 --> 00:20:03,919
spare him of having the free will

552
00:20:07,430 --> 00:20:04,799
god

553
00:20:09,750 --> 00:20:07,440
all right i'll do as you say

554
00:20:12,310 --> 00:20:09,760
but you do realize that this new you

555
00:20:14,710 --> 00:20:12,320
without free will will commit all sorts

556
00:20:17,110 --> 00:20:14,720
of horrible acts man

557
00:20:19,190 --> 00:20:17,120
but they will not be sins since you will

558
00:20:21,270 --> 00:20:19,200
have no free will god

559
00:20:23,190 --> 00:20:21,280
whether you call them sins or not the

560
00:20:25,430 --> 00:20:23,200
fact remains that they will be horrible

561
00:20:28,549 --> 00:20:25,440
acts in the sense that they will cause

562
00:20:30,710 --> 00:20:28,559
great pain to many sentient beings

563
00:20:33,270 --> 00:20:30,720

man after a long pause

564
00:20:36,070 --> 00:20:33,280
good god you have trapped me again

565
00:20:38,549 --> 00:20:36,080
always the same game if i now give you

566
00:20:41,110 --> 00:20:38,559
the go-ahead to create this new creature

567
00:20:43,669 --> 00:20:41,120
with no free will who will nevertheless

568
00:20:46,310 --> 00:20:43,679
commit atrocious acts then true enough

569
00:20:48,950 --> 00:20:46,320
he will not be sinning but i will be the

570
00:20:52,070 --> 00:20:48,960
sinner to sanction this god

571
00:20:54,390 --> 00:20:52,080
in that case i'll do you one better here

572
00:20:57,270 --> 00:20:54,400
i have already decided whether to create

573
00:20:58,549 --> 00:20:57,280
this new you this reborn you with free

574
00:21:00,710 --> 00:20:58,559
will or not

575
00:21:02,470 --> 00:21:00,720
now i am writing my decision on this

576
00:21:05,270 --> 00:21:02,480
piece of paper i shall not show you this

577
00:21:08,390 --> 00:21:05,280
paper until later but my decision is now

578
00:21:10,870 --> 00:21:08,400
made absolutely and irrevocably there is

579
00:21:13,190 --> 00:21:10,880
nothing you can do nothing you can do to

580
00:21:15,190 --> 00:21:13,200
alter it you have no responsibility in

581
00:21:18,710 --> 00:21:15,200
this matter

582
00:21:20,870 --> 00:21:18,720
now which way do you hope i have decided

583
00:21:24,070 --> 00:21:20,880
remember now the responsibility for the

584
00:21:26,310 --> 00:21:24,080
decision falls entirely on my shoulders

585
00:21:28,630 --> 00:21:26,320
not yours so

586
00:21:31,510 --> 00:21:28,640
you can tell me perfectly honestly

587
00:21:34,950 --> 00:21:31,520
without any fear which way do you hope i

588
00:21:36,710 --> 00:21:34,960

have decided man says after a very long

589
00:21:39,110 --> 00:21:36,720
pause

590
00:21:40,230 --> 00:21:39,120
i hope you have decided to give him free

591
00:21:41,430 --> 00:21:40,240
will

592
00:21:43,590 --> 00:21:41,440
god

593
00:21:46,070 --> 00:21:43,600
most interesting i have removed your

594
00:21:48,230 --> 00:21:46,080
last obstacle if i do not give him free

595
00:21:49,350 --> 00:21:48,240
will there is no sin to be imputed to

596
00:21:51,190 --> 00:21:49,360
anybody

597
00:21:52,070 --> 00:21:51,200
so why do you hope that i give him free

598
00:21:55,750 --> 00:21:52,080
will

599
00:21:57,909 --> 00:21:55,760
man because sin or no sin the important

600
00:21:59,430 --> 00:21:57,919
point is that if you do not give him

601
00:22:01,270 --> 00:21:59,440
free will then

602
00:22:04,149 --> 00:22:01,280
at least according to what you said he

603
00:22:06,870 --> 00:22:04,159
will go around hurting people

604
00:22:11,510 --> 00:22:06,880
and i don't want to see people hurt

605
00:22:15,510 --> 00:22:14,710
at last at last you see the real point

606
00:22:17,909 --> 00:22:15,520
man

607
00:22:19,750 --> 00:22:17,919
what point is that god that sinning is

608
00:22:21,510 --> 00:22:19,760
not the real issue

609
00:22:24,710 --> 00:22:21,520
the important thing is that other

610
00:22:27,270 --> 00:22:24,720
sentient beings do not get hurt man you

611
00:22:30,630 --> 00:22:27,280
sound like a utilitarian god i am a

612
00:22:33,750 --> 00:22:30,640
utilitarian man what god

613
00:22:35,590 --> 00:22:33,760

what's or no what i am a utilitarian

614
00:22:38,149 --> 00:22:35,600
not a unitarian mind you but a

615
00:22:41,190 --> 00:22:38,159
utilitarian

616
00:22:43,510 --> 00:22:41,200
man i just can't believe that god

617
00:22:45,590 --> 00:22:43,520
yes i know your religious training has

618
00:22:47,350 --> 00:22:45,600
taught you otherwise you've probably

619
00:22:49,350 --> 00:22:47,360
thought of me more like a kantian in the

620
00:22:52,630 --> 00:22:49,360
sense of immanuel kent than a

621
00:22:53,669 --> 00:22:52,640
utilitarian but your training was simply

622
00:22:57,750 --> 00:22:53,679
wrong

623
00:23:00,630 --> 00:22:57,760
man you leave me speechless god

624
00:23:02,950 --> 00:23:00,640
i leave you speechless do i well that's

625
00:23:05,270 --> 00:23:02,960
perhaps not too bad of a thing you have

626
00:23:07,590 --> 00:23:05,280
a tendency to speak too much as it is

627
00:23:09,909 --> 00:23:07,600
seriously though why do you think i ever

628
00:23:12,070 --> 00:23:09,919
gave you free will in the first place

629
00:23:14,149 --> 00:23:12,080
man why did you

630
00:23:16,070 --> 00:23:14,159
i never thought much about why you did

631
00:23:17,190 --> 00:23:16,080
it all i've been arguing is that you

632
00:23:17,990 --> 00:23:17,200
shouldn't have

633
00:23:19,350 --> 00:23:18,000
but

634
00:23:20,789 --> 00:23:19,360
why did you

635
00:23:23,270 --> 00:23:20,799
i guess all i can think of is the

636
00:23:25,270 --> 00:23:23,280
religious explanation without free will

637
00:23:27,750 --> 00:23:25,280
one is not capable of meriting either

638
00:23:29,990 --> 00:23:27,760

salvation or damnation so without free

639
00:23:32,230 --> 00:23:30,000
will one cannot earn the right to

640
00:23:34,630 --> 00:23:32,240
eternal life

641
00:23:35,510 --> 00:23:34,640
god says most interesting i have eternal

642
00:23:37,590 --> 00:23:35,520
life

643
00:23:39,510 --> 00:23:37,600
do you think i have done anything to

644
00:23:41,430 --> 00:23:39,520
merit that eternal life

645
00:23:43,750 --> 00:23:41,440
man of course not but with you it's

646
00:23:44,870 --> 00:23:43,760
different you're already so good and

647
00:23:46,950 --> 00:23:44,880
perfect

648
00:23:50,390 --> 00:23:46,960
at least allegedly that it's not

649
00:23:53,029 --> 00:23:50,400
necessary for you to merit eternal life

650
00:23:56,230 --> 00:23:53,039
god really now that puts me into a

651
00:23:59,029 --> 00:23:56,240
rather enviable position doesn't it man

652
00:24:01,750 --> 00:23:59,039
i don't think i understand you god

653
00:24:04,230 --> 00:24:01,760
here i am eternally blissful without

654
00:24:06,710 --> 00:24:04,240
ever having to suffer or make sacrifices

655
00:24:08,789 --> 00:24:06,720
or struggle against evil temptations or

656
00:24:11,830 --> 00:24:08,799
anything like that without any of that

657
00:24:13,029 --> 00:24:11,840
type of merit i enjoy a blissful eternal

658
00:24:15,990 --> 00:24:13,039
existence

659
00:24:18,390 --> 00:24:16,000
by contrast you poor mortals have to

660
00:24:20,950 --> 00:24:18,400
sweat and suffer and have all sorts of

661
00:24:22,549 --> 00:24:20,960
horrible conflicts about morality

662
00:24:24,149 --> 00:24:22,559
and all for what

663
00:24:25,590 --> 00:24:24,159

you don't even know whether or not i

664
00:24:27,669 --> 00:24:25,600
exist

665
00:24:29,590 --> 00:24:27,679
or if there's any afterlife no matter

666
00:24:32,149 --> 00:24:29,600
how much you try to placate me by being

667
00:24:34,789 --> 00:24:32,159
good you never have any real assurance

668
00:24:37,269 --> 00:24:34,799
that your best is good enough for me and

669
00:24:39,830 --> 00:24:37,279
hence no real security in obtaining

670
00:24:41,510 --> 00:24:39,840
salvation just think of it

671
00:24:43,430 --> 00:24:41,520
i already have the equivalent of

672
00:24:45,669 --> 00:24:43,440
salvation and i've never had to go

673
00:24:47,110 --> 00:24:45,679
through the infinitely luxurious process

674
00:24:50,310 --> 00:24:47,120
of earning it

675
00:24:53,430 --> 00:24:50,320
don't you ever envy me for this man

676
00:24:55,190 --> 00:24:53,440
but it's blasphemous to envy you god oh

677
00:24:56,950 --> 00:24:55,200
come off it you're not talking to your

678
00:24:59,269 --> 00:24:56,960
sunday school teacher you're talking to

679
00:25:01,350 --> 00:24:59,279
me blasphemous or not the important

680
00:25:03,430 --> 00:25:01,360
question is not whether or not you have

681
00:25:05,029 --> 00:25:03,440
a right to be envious of me but whether

682
00:25:08,310 --> 00:25:05,039
or not you are

683
00:25:09,669 --> 00:25:08,320
are you man of course i am

684
00:25:12,870 --> 00:25:09,679
commentary

685
00:25:14,630 --> 00:25:12,880
i wonder how much of

686
00:25:17,430 --> 00:25:14,640
the whole debate as to whether or not

687
00:25:19,029 --> 00:25:17,440
god exists comes from people who are

688
00:25:24,230 --> 00:25:19,039

envious of god

689
00:25:25,909 --> 00:25:24,240
way i'm not an atheist nor am i a theist

690
00:25:28,070 --> 00:25:25,919
at least i wouldn't classify myself as

691
00:25:29,830 --> 00:25:28,080
either an atheist or a theist i'm unsure

692
00:25:31,430 --> 00:25:29,840
and speculating in this regard though i

693
00:25:34,230 --> 00:25:31,440
am driven by the statement which says

694
00:25:36,230 --> 00:25:34,240
that we mortals scorn what we valiantly

695
00:25:38,310 --> 00:25:36,240
strive for but do not obtain

696
00:25:40,789 --> 00:25:38,320
that is we mortals scorn what we

697
00:25:43,750 --> 00:25:40,799
valiantly strive for but don't obtain

698
00:25:45,990 --> 00:25:43,760
back to the text

699
00:25:48,549 --> 00:25:46,000
man of course i'm jealous of you

700
00:25:51,430 --> 00:25:48,559
god good under your present world view

701
00:25:53,350 --> 00:25:51,440
you should be most envious of me but i

702
00:25:55,510 --> 00:25:53,360
think with a more realistic worldview

703
00:25:57,110 --> 00:25:55,520
you will no longer be so you really have

704
00:25:59,029 --> 00:25:57,120
swallowed this idea that's been taught

705
00:26:01,190 --> 00:25:59,039
to you that your life on earth is like

706
00:26:02,950 --> 00:26:01,200
an examination period and the purpose of

707
00:26:04,789 --> 00:26:02,960
providing you with free will is to test

708
00:26:07,750 --> 00:26:04,799
you to see if you merit a blissful

709
00:26:09,750 --> 00:26:07,760
eternal life but what puzzles me is this

710
00:26:12,549 --> 00:26:09,760
if you really believe i am as good and

711
00:26:14,390 --> 00:26:12,559
benevolent as i'm cracked up to be

712
00:26:16,470 --> 00:26:14,400
why should i require that people merit

713
00:26:17,990 --> 00:26:16,480

things like happiness or eternal life

714
00:26:20,470 --> 00:26:18,000
why should i not just grant that to

715
00:26:21,269 --> 00:26:20,480
everyone regardless of if they deserve

716
00:26:22,390 --> 00:26:21,279
it

717
00:26:23,909 --> 00:26:22,400
man

718
00:26:25,510 --> 00:26:23,919
but i've been taught that you have a

719
00:26:27,510 --> 00:26:25,520
sense of morality you have a sense of

720
00:26:29,590 --> 00:26:27,520
justice that demands goodness be

721
00:26:32,070 --> 00:26:29,600
rewarded with happiness and evil be

722
00:26:33,750 --> 00:26:32,080
punished with pain god

723
00:26:36,230 --> 00:26:33,760
then you've been taught wrong

724
00:26:38,630 --> 00:26:36,240
man but the religious literature is so

725
00:26:40,870 --> 00:26:38,640
full of this idea take for example

726
00:26:43,110 --> 00:26:40,880
jonathan edwards sinners in the hand of

727
00:26:44,870 --> 00:26:43,120
an angry god how he describes you as

728
00:26:47,669 --> 00:26:44,880
holding your enemies like loathsome

729
00:26:49,590 --> 00:26:47,679
scorpions over the flaming pit of hell

730
00:26:52,549 --> 00:26:49,600
preventing them from falling into the

731
00:26:54,149 --> 00:26:52,559
fate that they deserve only by dint of

732
00:26:55,029 --> 00:26:54,159
your mercy

733
00:26:57,029 --> 00:26:55,039
god

734
00:26:59,669 --> 00:26:57,039
fortunately i have not been exposed to

735
00:27:01,430 --> 00:26:59,679
the tirades of mr jonathan edwards

736
00:27:04,950 --> 00:27:01,440
few sermons have ever been preached

737
00:27:10,630 --> 00:27:07,909
the very title sinners in the hands of

738
00:27:12,870 --> 00:27:10,640

an angry god tells its own tale in the

739
00:27:14,950 --> 00:27:12,880
first place i am never angry in the

740
00:27:17,190 --> 00:27:14,960
second place i do not think at all in

741
00:27:20,149 --> 00:27:17,200
terms of sin in the third place i have

742
00:27:21,669 --> 00:27:20,159
no enemies man

743
00:27:23,669 --> 00:27:21,679
by that do you mean that there are no

744
00:27:25,750 --> 00:27:23,679
people whom you hate or there are no

745
00:27:28,149 --> 00:27:25,760
people who hate you

746
00:27:32,870 --> 00:27:28,159
god i meant the former although the

747
00:27:37,990 --> 00:27:35,750
man oh come now i know people who openly

748
00:27:39,510 --> 00:27:38,000
claim to have hated you or at times i

749
00:27:41,350 --> 00:27:39,520
have even hated you

750
00:27:43,510 --> 00:27:41,360
god

751
00:27:45,190 --> 00:27:43,520
you mean you have hated your image of me

752
00:27:46,630 --> 00:27:45,200
and that's not the same as hating what i

753
00:27:48,950 --> 00:27:46,640
really am

754
00:27:50,950 --> 00:27:48,960
man are you saying that it's not wrong

755
00:27:53,909 --> 00:27:50,960
to hate a false conception of you but it

756
00:27:56,710 --> 00:27:53,919
is wrong to hate you as you really are

757
00:27:58,870 --> 00:27:56,720
god no i'm not saying that at all what i

758
00:28:00,950 --> 00:27:58,880
am saying is far more drastic what i'm

759
00:28:03,430 --> 00:28:00,960
saying has absolutely nothing with right

760
00:28:06,230 --> 00:28:03,440
or wrong what i'm saying is that one who

761
00:28:09,909 --> 00:28:06,240
knows me for what i truly am will find

762
00:28:11,830 --> 00:28:09,919
it psychologically impossible to hate me

763
00:28:13,190 --> 00:28:11,840

commentary tyler goodstein made this

764
00:28:14,389 --> 00:28:13,200
point his channel is linked in the

765
00:28:17,510 --> 00:28:14,399
description

766
00:28:19,750 --> 00:28:17,520
that perhaps if you find no evidence of

767
00:28:21,990 --> 00:28:19,760
god or perhaps even if you hate god you

768
00:28:23,430 --> 00:28:22,000
should revise your definition of god and

769
00:28:25,510 --> 00:28:23,440
that's extremely interesting because the

770
00:28:27,190 --> 00:28:25,520
way that we're taught to think as

771
00:28:28,630 --> 00:28:27,200
rational people is you start with the

772
00:28:30,470 --> 00:28:28,640
definition then you go looking for the

773
00:28:32,310 --> 00:28:30,480
evidence this says rather than starting

774
00:28:34,310 --> 00:28:32,320
with your definition then looking for

775
00:28:36,389 --> 00:28:34,320
evidence and then subsequently

776
00:28:38,870 --> 00:28:36,399
dismissing the idea of god the fact that

777
00:28:40,789 --> 00:28:38,880
you dismiss the idea or that you don't

778
00:28:43,269 --> 00:28:40,799
find god indicates that you need to have

779
00:28:45,669 --> 00:28:43,279
a reassessment of your definition

780
00:28:47,029 --> 00:28:45,679
while i find that extremely interesting

781
00:28:50,070 --> 00:28:47,039
back to the text

782
00:28:52,470 --> 00:28:50,080
to recapitulate god what i am saying is

783
00:28:54,070 --> 00:28:52,480
that if one knows me for what i truly am

784
00:28:57,669 --> 00:28:54,080
one would find it psychologically

785
00:28:59,669 --> 00:28:57,679
impossible to hate me man tell me

786
00:29:01,110 --> 00:28:59,679
since we mortals seem to have such an

787
00:29:02,870 --> 00:29:01,120
erroneous view

788
00:29:04,710 --> 00:29:02,880

about your real nature

789
00:29:07,990 --> 00:29:04,720
why don't you enlighten us

790
00:29:09,269 --> 00:29:08,000
why don't you guide us the right way

791
00:29:11,350 --> 00:29:09,279
god

792
00:29:15,350 --> 00:29:11,360
what makes you think i'm not

793
00:29:18,549 --> 00:29:16,389
i mean

794
00:29:20,070 --> 00:29:18,559
why don't you appear to our very senses

795
00:29:21,430 --> 00:29:20,080
and simply tell us

796
00:29:22,389 --> 00:29:21,440
that we're wrong

797
00:29:24,549 --> 00:29:22,399
god

798
00:29:26,230 --> 00:29:24,559
are you really so naive as to believe

799
00:29:28,389 --> 00:29:26,240
that i am the sort of being which can

800
00:29:30,389 --> 00:29:28,399
appear to your senses

801
00:29:34,470 --> 00:29:30,399
it would be more correct to say that i

802
00:29:37,669 --> 00:29:34,480
am your senses man who's astonished says

803
00:29:39,669 --> 00:29:37,679
you are my senses god not quite i am

804
00:29:41,909 --> 00:29:39,679
more than that but it comes closer to

805
00:29:44,789 --> 00:29:41,919
the truth than that i am perceivable to

806
00:29:47,110 --> 00:29:44,799
your senses i am not an object like you

807
00:29:50,070 --> 00:29:47,120
i am a subject i am a subject that can

808
00:29:51,990 --> 00:29:50,080
perceive but cannot be perceived you can

809
00:29:53,190 --> 00:29:52,000
no more see me than you can see your own

810
00:29:55,269 --> 00:29:53,200
thoughts

811
00:29:57,430 --> 00:29:55,279
you can see an apple but the event of

812
00:29:59,430 --> 00:29:57,440
you seeing an apple is itself not

813
00:30:01,269 --> 00:29:59,440

seeable and i am far more like the

814
00:30:02,630 --> 00:30:01,279
seeing of an apple than i am like the

815
00:30:05,190 --> 00:30:02,640
apple itself

816
00:30:08,789 --> 00:30:05,200
man if i cannot see you how do i know

817
00:30:11,350 --> 00:30:08,799
you exist god good question how in fact

818
00:30:14,789 --> 00:30:11,360
do you know i exist man

819
00:30:15,990 --> 00:30:14,799
well i am talking to you am i not god

820
00:30:17,669 --> 00:30:16,000
how do you know that you're talking to

821
00:30:19,909 --> 00:30:17,679
me let's suppose you told your

822
00:30:21,350 --> 00:30:19,919
psychiatrist yesterday i talked to god

823
00:30:22,470 --> 00:30:21,360
what do you think that psychiatrist

824
00:30:25,909 --> 00:30:22,480
would say

825
00:30:28,070 --> 00:30:25,919
man well that might depend on the

826
00:30:29,510 --> 00:30:28,080
psychiatrist most of them are atheistic

827
00:30:32,070 --> 00:30:29,520
so i guess they would tell me i'm simply

828
00:30:35,750 --> 00:30:32,080
talking to myself god and they would be

829
00:30:37,669 --> 00:30:35,760
right man you mean you don't exist god

830
00:30:39,750 --> 00:30:37,679
you have the strangest faculty of

831
00:30:41,750 --> 00:30:39,760
drawing false conclusions just because

832
00:30:44,710 --> 00:30:41,760
you are talking to yourself it follows

833
00:30:46,870 --> 00:30:44,720
that i don't exist man well if i think

834
00:30:49,029 --> 00:30:46,880
i'm talking to you but i in fact i'm

835
00:30:50,470 --> 00:30:49,039
talking to myself then in what sense do

836
00:30:52,470 --> 00:30:50,480
you exist god

837
00:30:54,789 --> 00:30:52,480
god your question is based on two

838
00:30:56,470 --> 00:30:54,799

fallacies plus a confusion the question

839
00:30:58,230 --> 00:30:56,480
of whether or not you're now talking to

840
00:31:00,310 --> 00:30:58,240
me and the question of whether or not

841
00:31:02,470 --> 00:31:00,320
you and i are totally separate even if

842
00:31:04,870 --> 00:31:02,480
you are not now talking to me which

843
00:31:07,830 --> 00:31:04,880
obviously you are it still wouldn't mean

844
00:31:08,789 --> 00:31:07,840
that i don't exist man well i'll write

845
00:31:10,870 --> 00:31:08,799
of course

846
00:31:12,870 --> 00:31:10,880
so instead of saying if i'm talking to

847
00:31:14,549 --> 00:31:12,880
myself then you don't exist i should

848
00:31:16,630 --> 00:31:14,559
have rather said if i am talking to

849
00:31:17,590 --> 00:31:16,640
myself then i obviously am not talking

850
00:31:18,549 --> 00:31:17,600
to you

851
00:31:20,230 --> 00:31:18,559
god

852
00:31:23,750 --> 00:31:20,240
that's a very different statement indeed

853
00:31:25,909 --> 00:31:23,760
but still false man oh come on if i'm

854
00:31:27,350 --> 00:31:25,919
only talking to myself how can i be

855
00:31:28,149 --> 00:31:27,360
talking to you

856
00:31:30,549 --> 00:31:28,159
god

857
00:31:33,430 --> 00:31:30,559
your use of the word only is quite

858
00:31:35,909 --> 00:31:33,440
misleading i can suggest several logical

859
00:31:38,470 --> 00:31:35,919
possibilities under which you talking to

860
00:31:39,669 --> 00:31:38,480
yourself doesn't imply that you're not

861
00:31:44,230 --> 00:31:39,679
talking to me

862
00:31:46,310 --> 00:31:44,240
man suggest just one god well obviously

863
00:31:48,389 --> 00:31:46,320

one such possibility is that you and i

864
00:31:50,389 --> 00:31:48,399
are identical man that's such a

865
00:31:52,950 --> 00:31:50,399
blasphemous thought at least it would be

866
00:31:54,549 --> 00:31:52,960
had i uttered it god oh yes according to

867
00:31:56,870 --> 00:31:54,559
some religions though according to

868
00:31:58,830 --> 00:31:56,880
others it's plain simple immediately

869
00:32:02,470 --> 00:31:58,840
perceived as the truth

870
00:32:04,950 --> 00:32:02,480
man so the only way out of my dilemma is

871
00:32:05,750 --> 00:32:04,960
to believe that you and i are identical

872
00:32:09,430 --> 00:32:05,760
god

873
00:32:11,830 --> 00:32:09,440
not at all this is only one way out

874
00:32:14,549 --> 00:32:11,840
there are several others for example it

875
00:32:16,389 --> 00:32:14,559
may be that you're a part of me in which

876
00:32:19,669 --> 00:32:16,399
case you may be talking to the part of

877
00:32:22,149 --> 00:32:19,679
me which is you or that maybe i'm a part

878
00:32:25,430 --> 00:32:22,159
of you in which case you may be talking

879
00:32:27,909 --> 00:32:25,440
to that part of you which is me or again

880
00:32:29,990 --> 00:32:27,919
you and i might partially overlap in

881
00:32:32,310 --> 00:32:30,000
which case you may be talking to the

882
00:32:33,830 --> 00:32:32,320
intersection and hence talking to both

883
00:32:36,070 --> 00:32:33,840
you and to me

884
00:32:37,430 --> 00:32:36,080
the only way you're talking to yourself

885
00:32:39,029 --> 00:32:37,440
might seem to imply that you're not

886
00:32:41,830 --> 00:32:39,039
talking to me is if you and i were

887
00:32:44,389 --> 00:32:41,840
totally disjoint and even then you could

888
00:32:47,350 --> 00:32:44,399

conceivably be talking to both of us

889
00:32:50,230 --> 00:32:47,360
man so you claim you do exist

890
00:32:52,710 --> 00:32:50,240
god not at all again you draw false

891
00:32:55,269 --> 00:32:52,720
conclusions the question of my existence

892
00:32:56,870 --> 00:32:55,279
has not even come up all i have said is

893
00:32:59,750 --> 00:32:56,880
from the fact that you are talking to

894
00:33:02,389 --> 00:32:59,760
yourself one cannot possibly infer my

895
00:33:06,149 --> 00:33:02,399
non-existence let alone the weaker fact

896
00:33:10,230 --> 00:33:08,549
man all right i'll grant you your point

897
00:33:11,430 --> 00:33:10,240
but what i really want to know is do you

898
00:33:15,190 --> 00:33:11,440
exist

899
00:33:16,870 --> 00:33:15,200
god what a strange question man why

900
00:33:19,269 --> 00:33:16,880
men have been asking this for countless

901
00:33:21,110 --> 00:33:19,279
millennia god i know that the question

902
00:33:23,029 --> 00:33:21,120
itself is not strange what i mean is

903
00:33:26,950 --> 00:33:23,039
that it's strange of you to ask that of

904
00:33:29,110 --> 00:33:26,960
me man why god because i'm the very one

905
00:33:31,350 --> 00:33:29,120
whose existence you doubt

906
00:33:33,110 --> 00:33:31,360
i perfectly well understand your anxiety

907
00:33:34,549 --> 00:33:33,120
you are worried that your present

908
00:33:36,710 --> 00:33:34,559
experience with me is a mere

909
00:33:39,350 --> 00:33:36,720
hallucination but how can you possibly

910
00:33:41,430 --> 00:33:39,360
expect to obtain reliable information

911
00:33:43,190 --> 00:33:41,440
from a being about that being's

912
00:33:46,230 --> 00:33:43,200
existence when you suspect the

913
00:33:47,190 --> 00:33:46,240

non-existence of that very same being

914
00:33:49,110 --> 00:33:47,200
man

915
00:33:49,990 --> 00:33:49,120
so you won't tell me whether or not you

916
00:33:52,389 --> 00:33:50,000
exist

917
00:33:54,630 --> 00:33:52,399
god i am not being willful

918
00:33:56,389 --> 00:33:54,640
i am merely wishing to point out to you

919
00:33:58,630 --> 00:33:56,399
that no one could possibly give you an

920
00:34:01,029 --> 00:33:58,640
answer that would satisfy you all right

921
00:34:03,750 --> 00:34:01,039
suppose i said no i don't exist well

922
00:34:06,389 --> 00:34:03,760
what would that prove absolutely nothing

923
00:34:08,790 --> 00:34:06,399
or perhaps i said yes i do exist

924
00:34:10,710 --> 00:34:08,800
would that convince you of course not

925
00:34:12,629 --> 00:34:10,720
man says

926
00:34:14,950 --> 00:34:12,639
well if you can't tell me whether or not

927
00:34:16,389 --> 00:34:14,960
you exist then who possibly can

928
00:34:18,149 --> 00:34:16,399
god

929
00:34:19,349 --> 00:34:18,159
that is something that no one can tell

930
00:34:24,869 --> 00:34:19,359
you

931
00:34:26,629 --> 00:34:24,879
man

932
00:34:27,669 --> 00:34:26,639
how do i go about finding this out for

933
00:34:29,030 --> 00:34:27,679
myself

934
00:34:31,909 --> 00:34:29,040
god

935
00:34:33,349 --> 00:34:31,919
that also no one can tell you

936
00:34:35,909 --> 00:34:33,359
this is another thing you will have to

937
00:34:37,510 --> 00:34:35,919
find out for yourself

938
00:34:39,510 --> 00:34:37,520

commentary

939
00:34:42,069 --> 00:34:39,520
about this channel the name is theories

940
00:34:44,550 --> 00:34:42,079
of everything which is an audacious goal

941
00:34:46,149 --> 00:34:44,560
to explain everything well firstly there

942
00:34:47,510 --> 00:34:46,159
are many different interpretations of

943
00:34:49,270 --> 00:34:47,520
what it means to be a theory of

944
00:34:51,109 --> 00:34:49,280
everything one is physics one is a

945
00:34:52,710 --> 00:34:51,119
reductionist account to explain all

946
00:34:54,790 --> 00:34:52,720
phenomenon which sounds like a physics

947
00:34:56,790 --> 00:34:54,800
term but it depends if you think physics

948
00:34:58,390 --> 00:34:56,800
is the be all in and all but i think a

949
00:35:00,150 --> 00:34:58,400
better way to understand this channel is

950
00:35:02,870 --> 00:35:00,160
to think of it in terms of an

951
00:35:05,030 --> 00:35:02,880
exploration or a search for the answers

952
00:35:07,510 --> 00:35:05,040
to large mysteries

953
00:35:08,950 --> 00:35:07,520
as well as what those mysteries are

954
00:35:10,550 --> 00:35:08,960
the reason i say that last point is

955
00:35:12,550 --> 00:35:10,560
because it's not clear exactly what

956
00:35:14,310 --> 00:35:12,560
consciousness is we still need a refined

957
00:35:16,870 --> 00:35:14,320
definition it's not clear you can even

958
00:35:19,030 --> 00:35:16,880
define it because some people think that

959
00:35:21,270 --> 00:35:19,040
consciousness is the same as all and so

960
00:35:23,910 --> 00:35:21,280
to define means to delimit and you can't

961
00:35:26,069 --> 00:35:23,920
limit all back to the text

962
00:35:28,069 --> 00:35:26,079
man so there's no way you can help me

963
00:35:30,390 --> 00:35:28,079

find out whether or not you exist or how

964
00:35:32,150 --> 00:35:30,400
to find out whether or not you exist god

965
00:35:33,670 --> 00:35:32,160
i didn't say that i said there's no way

966
00:35:36,069 --> 00:35:33,680
i can tell you but that doesn't mean

967
00:35:39,430 --> 00:35:36,079
there's no way i can help you man in

968
00:35:40,390 --> 00:35:39,440
what manner then can you help me

969
00:35:42,069 --> 00:35:40,400
god

970
00:35:44,310 --> 00:35:42,079
i suggest you leave that to me we've

971
00:35:46,390 --> 00:35:44,320
gotten sidetracked as it is and i'd like

972
00:35:48,069 --> 00:35:46,400
to return to the question of what you

973
00:35:50,069 --> 00:35:48,079
believed my purpose to be in giving you

974
00:35:51,829 --> 00:35:50,079
free will your first idea of me giving

975
00:35:53,750 --> 00:35:51,839
you free will was in order to test

976
00:35:55,109 --> 00:35:53,760
whether or not you merit salvation or

977
00:35:57,670 --> 00:35:55,119
damnation

978
00:35:59,670 --> 00:35:57,680
but that idea is quite hideous to me you

979
00:36:02,230 --> 00:35:59,680
cannot think of any nicer reason any

980
00:36:03,270 --> 00:36:02,240
more humane reason why i gave you free

981
00:36:06,150 --> 00:36:03,280
will

982
00:36:07,910 --> 00:36:06,160
man well i once asked this question of

983
00:36:10,069 --> 00:36:07,920
an orthodox rabbi

984
00:36:11,670 --> 00:36:10,079
he told me that the way were constituted

985
00:36:13,750 --> 00:36:11,680
is that it's simply not impossible for

986
00:36:15,750 --> 00:36:13,760
us to enjoy salvation unless we've

987
00:36:17,270 --> 00:36:15,760
earned it and to earn it we of course

988
00:36:19,670 --> 00:36:17,280

need free will

989
00:36:21,910 --> 00:36:19,680
god that explanation is indeed much

990
00:36:23,750 --> 00:36:21,920
nicer than the former but it's still far

991
00:36:26,390 --> 00:36:23,760
from correct according to orthodox

992
00:36:28,790 --> 00:36:26,400
judaism i created angels and they have

993
00:36:30,790 --> 00:36:28,800
no free will they are an actual sight of

994
00:36:32,710 --> 00:36:30,800
me and so are completely attracted to my

995
00:36:35,430 --> 00:36:32,720
goodness such that they never even have

996
00:36:36,950 --> 00:36:35,440
the slightest temptation toward evil

997
00:36:38,950 --> 00:36:36,960
they really have no choice in the matter

998
00:36:40,390 --> 00:36:38,960
yet they're eternally happy even though

999
00:36:42,710 --> 00:36:40,400
they've never earned it so if your

1000
00:36:44,950 --> 00:36:42,720
rabbi's explanation was correct why

1001
00:36:46,470 --> 00:36:44,960
wouldn't i have simply created angels

1002
00:36:49,990 --> 00:36:46,480
rather than mortals

1003
00:36:51,750 --> 00:36:50,000
man beats me why didn't you god

1004
00:36:53,589 --> 00:36:51,760
because the explanation is simply not

1005
00:36:55,829 --> 00:36:53,599
correct in the first place i've never

1006
00:36:57,750 --> 00:36:55,839
created any ready-made angels all

1007
00:36:59,990 --> 00:36:57,760
sentient beings ultimately approach the

1008
00:37:02,310 --> 00:37:00,000
state that we might call angelhood but

1009
00:37:04,390 --> 00:37:02,320
just as the race of human beings or the

1010
00:37:07,589 --> 00:37:04,400
species of human beings is in a certain

1011
00:37:09,670 --> 00:37:07,599
stage of biological evolution so angels

1012
00:37:11,829 --> 00:37:09,680
are simply the end result of a process

1013
00:37:13,349 --> 00:37:11,839

of cosmic evolution the only difference

1014
00:37:15,670 --> 00:37:13,359
between the so-called saint and the

1015
00:37:18,310 --> 00:37:15,680
so-called sinner is that the former is

1016
00:37:20,710 --> 00:37:18,320
vastly older than the latter

1017
00:37:22,950 --> 00:37:20,720
unfortunately it takes countless life

1018
00:37:25,990 --> 00:37:22,960
cycles to learn what is perhaps the most

1019
00:37:29,349 --> 00:37:26,000
important fact of the universe

1020
00:37:31,510 --> 00:37:29,359
evil is simply painful

1021
00:37:33,589 --> 00:37:31,520
all the arguments of the moralists all

1022
00:37:36,150 --> 00:37:33,599
the alleged reasons why people should or

1023
00:37:38,870 --> 00:37:36,160
shouldn't commit evil acts simply pale

1024
00:37:42,470 --> 00:37:38,880
into insignificance in light of this one

1025
00:37:45,349 --> 00:37:42,480
basic truth that evil is suffering

1026
00:37:47,750 --> 00:37:45,359
no my dear friend i am not a moralist i

1027
00:37:49,430 --> 00:37:47,760
am wholly a utilitarian

1028
00:37:51,270 --> 00:37:49,440
that i'm conceived in the role of a

1029
00:37:53,670 --> 00:37:51,280
moralist is one of the great tragedies

1030
00:37:54,950 --> 00:37:53,680
of the human race my role in the scheme

1031
00:37:56,550 --> 00:37:54,960
of things

1032
00:37:58,950 --> 00:37:56,560
if one can use this misleading

1033
00:38:01,430 --> 00:37:58,960
expression is neither to punish nor

1034
00:38:03,829 --> 00:38:01,440
reward but to aid the process by which

1035
00:38:05,670 --> 00:38:03,839
all sentient beings achieve ultimate

1036
00:38:07,670 --> 00:38:05,680
perfection

1037
00:38:09,430 --> 00:38:07,680
man

1038
00:38:11,030 --> 00:38:09,440

why did you say your expression is

1039
00:38:12,310 --> 00:38:11,040
misleading

1040
00:38:14,230 --> 00:38:12,320
god

1041
00:38:16,790 --> 00:38:14,240
what i said was misleading in two

1042
00:38:19,030 --> 00:38:16,800
respects firstly it's inaccurate to

1043
00:38:21,349 --> 00:38:19,040
speak of my role in the scheme of things

1044
00:38:23,910 --> 00:38:21,359
i am the scheme of things

1045
00:38:25,829 --> 00:38:23,920
secondly it's equally misleading to

1046
00:38:27,990 --> 00:38:25,839
speak of my aiding the process of

1047
00:38:30,390 --> 00:38:28,000
sentient beings attaining enlightenment

1048
00:38:32,470 --> 00:38:30,400
i am the process the ancient taoists

1049
00:38:34,069 --> 00:38:32,480
were quite close when they said of me

1050
00:38:36,630 --> 00:38:34,079
whom they called the tau

1051
00:38:38,870 --> 00:38:36,640
that i do not do things yet through me

1052
00:38:41,349 --> 00:38:38,880
all things get done

1053
00:38:43,990 --> 00:38:41,359
in more modern terms i am not the cause

1054
00:38:46,470 --> 00:38:44,000
of a cosmic process i am the cosmic

1055
00:38:48,310 --> 00:38:46,480
process itself i think the most accurate

1056
00:38:49,349 --> 00:38:48,320
and fruitful definition of me which man

1057
00:38:50,790 --> 00:38:49,359
can frame

1058
00:38:53,990 --> 00:38:50,800
at least in his present state of

1059
00:38:56,230 --> 00:38:54,000
evolution is that i am the very process

1060
00:38:58,390 --> 00:38:56,240
of enlightenment those who wish to think

1061
00:38:59,349 --> 00:38:58,400
of the devil although i wish they

1062
00:39:01,109 --> 00:38:59,359
wouldn't

1063
00:39:02,710 --> 00:39:01,119

might analogously define him as the

1064
00:39:04,310 --> 00:39:02,720
unfortunate length of time that that

1065
00:39:07,750 --> 00:39:04,320
process takes

1066
00:39:09,990 --> 00:39:07,760
in this sense the devil is necessary

1067
00:39:11,990 --> 00:39:10,000
the process simply does take an

1068
00:39:14,550 --> 00:39:12,000
inordinate amount of time and there's

1069
00:39:16,950 --> 00:39:14,560
absolutely nothing i can do about that

1070
00:39:19,430 --> 00:39:16,960
but i assure you once that process is

1071
00:39:21,109 --> 00:39:19,440
more correctly understood the painful

1072
00:39:23,349 --> 00:39:21,119
length of time will no longer be

1073
00:39:25,990 --> 00:39:23,359
regarded as an essential limitation or

1074
00:39:28,870 --> 00:39:26,000
an evil it will simply be seen as the

1075
00:39:30,950 --> 00:39:28,880
very essence of the process itself i

1076
00:39:33,109 --> 00:39:30,960
know this is not completely consoling to

1077
00:39:35,270 --> 00:39:33,119
you who are now in the finite sea of

1078
00:39:37,589 --> 00:39:35,280
suffering but the amazing thing is that

1079
00:39:39,670 --> 00:39:37,599
once you grasp this fundamental attitude

1080
00:39:42,150 --> 00:39:39,680
your very finite suffering will begin to

1081
00:39:43,349 --> 00:39:42,160
diminish ultimately to the vanishing

1082
00:39:45,270 --> 00:39:43,359
point

1083
00:39:48,230 --> 00:39:45,280
man

1084
00:39:49,990 --> 00:39:48,240
yes i've been told this and

1085
00:39:51,829 --> 00:39:50,000
i tend to believe it

1086
00:39:54,470 --> 00:39:51,839
but suppose i personally succeed in

1087
00:39:56,710 --> 00:39:54,480
seeing things through your eternal eyes

1088
00:39:58,470 --> 00:39:56,720

then i will be happier but don't i have

1089
00:40:00,310 --> 00:39:58,480
a duty to others

1090
00:40:02,950 --> 00:40:00,320
god laughing

1091
00:40:05,990 --> 00:40:02,960
you remind me of the mahayana buddhists

1092
00:40:07,750 --> 00:40:06,000
each one says i will never enter nirvana

1093
00:40:09,829 --> 00:40:07,760
until i see that every other sentient

1094
00:40:12,069 --> 00:40:09,839
being does so so each one waits until

1095
00:40:13,990 --> 00:40:12,079
the other fellow goes first

1096
00:40:15,829 --> 00:40:14,000
no wonder it takes them so long the

1097
00:40:18,230 --> 00:40:15,839
hinayana buddhists air in a different

1098
00:40:19,829 --> 00:40:18,240
direction they believe that no one can

1099
00:40:22,069 --> 00:40:19,839
be of the slightest help to others in

1100
00:40:24,550 --> 00:40:22,079
obtaining salvation each one has to do

1101
00:40:26,630 --> 00:40:24,560
it entirely by themselves and so each

1102
00:40:29,109 --> 00:40:26,640
one tries for their own salvation but

1103
00:40:31,270 --> 00:40:29,119
this detached attitude makes salvation

1104
00:40:33,030 --> 00:40:31,280
impossible the truth of the matter is

1105
00:40:36,150 --> 00:40:33,040
that salvation is partially an

1106
00:40:38,870 --> 00:40:36,160
individual and partly a social process

1107
00:40:41,349 --> 00:40:38,880
but it is a grave mistake to believe as

1108
00:40:43,589 --> 00:40:41,359
do many mahayana buddhists that the

1109
00:40:45,589 --> 00:40:43,599
attaining of enlightenment puts one out

1110
00:40:46,550 --> 00:40:45,599
of commission so to speak for helping

1111
00:40:50,870 --> 00:40:46,560
others

1112
00:40:52,390 --> 00:40:50,880
is by first seeing the light

1113
00:40:55,430 --> 00:40:52,400

oneself

1114
00:40:57,750 --> 00:40:56,470
there is one thing about your

1115
00:40:58,870 --> 00:40:57,760
self-description which is somewhat

1116
00:41:00,950 --> 00:40:58,880
disturbing

1117
00:41:03,109 --> 00:41:00,960
you describe yourself essentially as a

1118
00:41:05,109 --> 00:41:03,119
process this puts you in such an

1119
00:41:07,109 --> 00:41:05,119
impersonal light and so many people have

1120
00:41:08,710 --> 00:41:07,119
a need for a personal god

1121
00:41:12,550 --> 00:41:08,720
god

1122
00:41:15,670 --> 00:41:12,560
it follows that i am one

1123
00:41:18,069 --> 00:41:15,680
man of course not but to be acceptable

1124
00:41:21,430 --> 00:41:18,079
to immortal a religion must satisfy his

1125
00:41:23,750 --> 00:41:21,440
needs god i realize that but this

1126
00:41:25,910 --> 00:41:23,760
so-called personality of a being is

1127
00:41:27,829 --> 00:41:25,920
really more in the eyes of the beholder

1128
00:41:29,670 --> 00:41:27,839
than in the being itself

1129
00:41:31,510 --> 00:41:29,680
the controversies which have raged about

1130
00:41:33,589 --> 00:41:31,520
whether or not i am a personal or an

1131
00:41:36,150 --> 00:41:33,599
impersonal being are rather silly

1132
00:41:38,950 --> 00:41:36,160
because neither side is right or wrong

1133
00:41:40,870 --> 00:41:38,960
from one point of view i'm personal from

1134
00:41:43,190 --> 00:41:40,880
another i'm not

1135
00:41:45,109 --> 00:41:43,200
it's the same with a human being a

1136
00:41:48,790 --> 00:41:45,119
creature from another planet may look at

1137
00:41:50,390 --> 00:41:48,800
that human purely impersonally as a mere

1138
00:41:53,349 --> 00:41:50,400

collection of particles according to

1139
00:41:56,069 --> 00:41:53,359
which they act strictly to prescribe

1140
00:41:58,230 --> 00:41:56,079
physical law that alien may have no more

1141
00:42:00,390 --> 00:41:58,240
feeling for the personality of the human

1142
00:42:02,069 --> 00:42:00,400
than the average human does for an ant

1143
00:42:04,550 --> 00:42:02,079
yet the ant has just as much an

1144
00:42:06,950 --> 00:42:04,560
individual personality as a human to

1145
00:42:09,589 --> 00:42:06,960
beings like myself who really know the

1146
00:42:11,910 --> 00:42:09,599
ant to look at something impersonally is

1147
00:42:14,550 --> 00:42:11,920
no more correct or incorrect than to

1148
00:42:16,069 --> 00:42:14,560
look at it personally but in general the

1149
00:42:18,230 --> 00:42:16,079
better you get to know something the

1150
00:42:19,510 --> 00:42:18,240
more personal it becomes to illustrate

1151
00:42:22,470 --> 00:42:19,520
my point

1152
00:42:24,710 --> 00:42:22,480
do you think of me as a personal or an

1153
00:42:27,349 --> 00:42:24,720
impersonal being

1154
00:42:30,069 --> 00:42:27,359
man well i am talking to you am i not

1155
00:42:31,750 --> 00:42:30,079
god exactly now from that point of view

1156
00:42:34,390 --> 00:42:31,760
your attitude toward me might be

1157
00:42:37,910 --> 00:42:34,400
described as a personal one and yet from

1158
00:42:41,190 --> 00:42:37,920
another point of view no less valid

1159
00:42:43,109 --> 00:42:41,200
i can also be looked at impersonally man

1160
00:42:46,470 --> 00:42:43,119
but if you're really such an abstract

1161
00:42:48,390 --> 00:42:46,480
thing as a process i don't see

1162
00:42:50,230 --> 00:42:48,400
how i can make sense of what it means to

1163
00:42:52,950 --> 00:42:50,240

talk to a mere process

1164
00:42:54,710 --> 00:42:52,960
god i love how you say the word mir

1165
00:42:56,630 --> 00:42:54,720
you might as well just say you're living

1166
00:42:58,950 --> 00:42:56,640
in a mere universe

1167
00:42:59,990 --> 00:42:58,960
also why must everything one does make

1168
00:43:04,390 --> 00:43:00,000
sense

1169
00:43:06,710 --> 00:43:04,400
of course not god

1170
00:43:07,829 --> 00:43:06,720
and yet many children and primitives do

1171
00:43:10,390 --> 00:43:07,839
just that

1172
00:43:11,510 --> 00:43:10,400
man well i'm neither a child nor a

1173
00:43:14,870 --> 00:43:11,520
primitive

1174
00:43:17,349 --> 00:43:14,880
god i realize that unfortunately man

1175
00:43:19,270 --> 00:43:17,359
why unfortunately god because many

1176
00:43:21,270 --> 00:43:19,280
children and primitives have a primal

1177
00:43:22,309 --> 00:43:21,280
intuition which the likes of you have

1178
00:43:25,270 --> 00:43:22,319
lost

1179
00:43:27,270 --> 00:43:25,280
frankly i think it would do you a lot of

1180
00:43:29,910 --> 00:43:27,280
good to talk to a tree every once in a

1181
00:43:32,309 --> 00:43:29,920
while even more good than talking to me

1182
00:43:34,390 --> 00:43:32,319
but we do seem to be getting sidetracked

1183
00:43:35,270 --> 00:43:34,400
let's get back to why i gave you free

1184
00:43:37,190 --> 00:43:35,280
will

1185
00:43:40,069 --> 00:43:37,200
man i have been thinking about this all

1186
00:43:41,990 --> 00:43:40,079
the while god you mean you haven't been

1187
00:43:43,829 --> 00:43:42,000
paying attention during a conversation

1188
00:43:45,589 --> 00:43:43,839

man of course i have but all the while

1189
00:43:48,230 --> 00:43:45,599
on another level i have been thinking

1190
00:43:50,710 --> 00:43:48,240
about why did you give me free will god

1191
00:43:51,589 --> 00:43:50,720
okay have you come to a conclusion

1192
00:43:52,470 --> 00:43:51,599
man

1193
00:43:54,390 --> 00:43:52,480
well

1194
00:43:56,069 --> 00:43:54,400
you say that the reason is not to test

1195
00:43:57,750 --> 00:43:56,079
our worthiness

1196
00:43:59,670 --> 00:43:57,760
and you disclaimed that the reason is

1197
00:44:01,829 --> 00:43:59,680
that we need to feel that we merit some

1198
00:44:03,990 --> 00:44:01,839
things in order to enjoy them and you

1199
00:44:06,230 --> 00:44:04,000
claim to be a utilitarian most

1200
00:44:08,150 --> 00:44:06,240
significant of all you also appeared so

1201
00:44:10,630 --> 00:44:08,160
delighted when it came to the sudden

1202
00:44:12,790 --> 00:44:10,640
realization that it is not sinning in

1203
00:44:14,390 --> 00:44:12,800
itself which is bad but the suffering

1204
00:44:16,390 --> 00:44:14,400
which it causes

1205
00:44:19,190 --> 00:44:16,400
god well of course

1206
00:44:20,390 --> 00:44:19,200
what else could be conceivably bad about

1207
00:44:23,510 --> 00:44:20,400
sinning

1208
00:44:24,390 --> 00:44:23,520
man all right you know that now i know

1209
00:44:26,550 --> 00:44:24,400
that

1210
00:44:28,710 --> 00:44:26,560
but all my life i unfortunately have

1211
00:44:31,190 --> 00:44:28,720
been under the influence of moralists

1212
00:44:33,829 --> 00:44:31,200
who hold sinning to be bad in itself

1213
00:44:35,990 --> 00:44:33,839

anyway putting all these pieces together

1214
00:44:38,630 --> 00:44:36,000
it occurs to me that the only reason you

1215
00:44:40,790 --> 00:44:38,640
gave free will is because of your belief

1216
00:44:42,069 --> 00:44:40,800
that with free will people will tend to

1217
00:44:44,470 --> 00:44:42,079
hurt each other

1218
00:44:45,510 --> 00:44:44,480
and themselves less than without free

1219
00:44:48,150 --> 00:44:45,520
will

1220
00:44:54,230 --> 00:44:51,190
bravo that is by far the best reason you

1221
00:44:56,710 --> 00:44:54,240
have yet given i can assure you that had

1222
00:44:58,950 --> 00:44:56,720
i chosen to give you free will that

1223
00:45:01,750 --> 00:44:58,960
would have been my very reason for doing

1224
00:45:04,550 --> 00:45:01,760
so man what you're saying that you did

1225
00:45:05,750 --> 00:45:04,560
not choose to give me free will god my

1226
00:45:07,990 --> 00:45:05,760
dear fellow

1227
00:45:09,109 --> 00:45:08,000
i could no more choose to give you

1228
00:45:10,470 --> 00:45:09,119
free will

1229
00:45:13,910 --> 00:45:10,480
then i could choose to make an

1230
00:45:15,910 --> 00:45:13,920
equilateral triangle equiangular i could

1231
00:45:18,390 --> 00:45:15,920
choose to make or not to make an

1232
00:45:20,470 --> 00:45:18,400
equilateral triangle in the first place

1233
00:45:22,710 --> 00:45:20,480
but then once i've chosen to make one i

1234
00:45:24,069 --> 00:45:22,720
no longer have the choice but to make it

1235
00:45:26,710 --> 00:45:24,079
equiangular

1236
00:45:28,950 --> 00:45:26,720
man i thought you could do anything god

1237
00:45:31,190 --> 00:45:28,960
only things that are logically possible

1238
00:45:33,030 --> 00:45:31,200

as saint thomas said it is a sin to

1239
00:45:35,990 --> 00:45:33,040
regard the fact that god cannot do the

1240
00:45:38,550 --> 00:45:36,000
impossible as a limitation on his powers

1241
00:45:39,910 --> 00:45:38,560
i agree except in

1242
00:45:42,630 --> 00:45:39,920
the fact that i wouldn't use the term

1243
00:45:44,470 --> 00:45:42,640
sin i would use the term error man

1244
00:45:46,069 --> 00:45:44,480
anyway i'm still puzzled by your

1245
00:45:47,589 --> 00:45:46,079
implication that you did not choose to

1246
00:45:50,069 --> 00:45:47,599
give me free will

1247
00:45:52,150 --> 00:45:50,079
god well it's high time that i inform

1248
00:45:54,390 --> 00:45:52,160
you that this entire discussion from the

1249
00:45:55,990 --> 00:45:54,400
very beginning has been based on one

1250
00:45:58,069 --> 00:45:56,000
monstrous fallacy

1251
00:45:59,990 --> 00:45:58,079
we have been talking purely on a moral

1252
00:46:02,390 --> 00:46:00,000
level you originally complained that i

1253
00:46:03,829 --> 00:46:02,400
gave you free will and raised the whole

1254
00:46:06,790 --> 00:46:03,839
question as to whether or not i should

1255
00:46:09,670 --> 00:46:06,800
have it never occurred to you that i had

1256
00:46:10,630 --> 00:46:09,680
absolutely no choice in the matter

1257
00:46:13,910 --> 00:46:10,640
man

1258
00:46:17,510 --> 00:46:15,990
god absolutely

1259
00:46:19,670 --> 00:46:17,520
because you're only able to look at it

1260
00:46:21,670 --> 00:46:19,680
through the eyes of a moralist the more

1261
00:46:24,630 --> 00:46:21,680
fundamental metaphysical aspects of the

1262
00:46:26,829 --> 00:46:24,640
question you never even considered man i

1263
00:46:30,069 --> 00:46:26,839

still don't see what you're driving at

1264
00:46:31,670 --> 00:46:30,079
god before you requested me to remove

1265
00:46:33,430 --> 00:46:31,680
your free will

1266
00:46:34,470 --> 00:46:33,440
shouldn't your first question have been

1267
00:46:36,390 --> 00:46:34,480
whether

1268
00:46:37,750 --> 00:46:36,400
as a matter of fact that you do have

1269
00:46:40,230 --> 00:46:37,760
free will

1270
00:46:43,829 --> 00:46:40,240
man well i simply took that for granted

1271
00:46:46,950 --> 00:46:43,839
god but why should you man i don't know

1272
00:46:48,550 --> 00:46:46,960
do i have free will god yes

1273
00:46:50,950 --> 00:46:48,560
man then why would you say that i

1274
00:46:52,550 --> 00:46:50,960
shouldn't have taken it for granted god

1275
00:46:54,470 --> 00:46:52,560
because you shouldn't just because

1276
00:46:55,670 --> 00:46:54,480
something happens to be true it doesn't

1277
00:46:56,550 --> 00:46:55,680
follow that it should be taken for

1278
00:46:58,950 --> 00:46:56,560
granted

1279
00:47:00,950 --> 00:46:58,960
man anyway it's reassuring to know that

1280
00:47:03,190 --> 00:47:00,960
my natural intuition about having free

1281
00:47:04,790 --> 00:47:03,200
will is correct

1282
00:47:07,430 --> 00:47:04,800
sometimes i've been worried that the

1283
00:47:09,430 --> 00:47:07,440
determinists are correct god

1284
00:47:12,390 --> 00:47:09,440
they are correct man

1285
00:47:15,430 --> 00:47:12,400
wait a minute now do i have free will or

1286
00:47:17,030 --> 00:47:15,440
don't i god i told you that you do but

1287
00:47:19,349 --> 00:47:17,040
that doesn't mean determinism is

1288
00:47:21,829 --> 00:47:19,359

incorrect man

1289
00:47:24,950 --> 00:47:21,839
well are my acts determined by the laws

1290
00:47:27,349 --> 00:47:24,960
of nature or are not they god

1291
00:47:29,190 --> 00:47:27,359
the word determined here is a subtle but

1292
00:47:31,829 --> 00:47:29,200
powerfully misleading one and has

1293
00:47:33,670 --> 00:47:31,839
contributed so much to the confusion of

1294
00:47:35,430 --> 00:47:33,680
the free will versus determinism

1295
00:47:37,270 --> 00:47:35,440
controversies

1296
00:47:38,870 --> 00:47:37,280
your acts are certainly in accordance

1297
00:47:41,030 --> 00:47:38,880
with the laws of nature

1298
00:47:43,190 --> 00:47:41,040
but to say that they are determined by

1299
00:47:45,829 --> 00:47:43,200
the laws of nature creates a totally

1300
00:47:47,510 --> 00:47:45,839
misleading psychological image which is

1301
00:47:49,829 --> 00:47:47,520
that your will could somehow be in

1302
00:47:52,150 --> 00:47:49,839
conflict with the laws of nature and

1303
00:47:54,790 --> 00:47:52,160
that the latter is somehow more powerful

1304
00:47:57,109 --> 00:47:54,800
than you and could determine your acts

1305
00:47:59,349 --> 00:47:57,119
whether you liked it or not

1306
00:48:02,390 --> 00:47:59,359
but it's simply impossible for your will

1307
00:48:05,670 --> 00:48:02,400
to ever be in conflict with natural law

1308
00:48:08,309 --> 00:48:05,680
you and natural law are really one and

1309
00:48:11,430 --> 00:48:09,349
man

1310
00:48:13,430 --> 00:48:11,440
what do you mean that i cannot conflict

1311
00:48:15,910 --> 00:48:13,440
with nature suppose i become very

1312
00:48:17,430 --> 00:48:15,920
stubborn and i determine not to obey the

1313
00:48:19,190 --> 00:48:17,440

laws of nature

1314
00:48:20,790 --> 00:48:19,200
what could stop me if i became

1315
00:48:23,270 --> 00:48:20,800
sufficiently stubborn

1316
00:48:24,870 --> 00:48:23,280
even you could not stop me god you're

1317
00:48:26,790 --> 00:48:24,880
absolutely right i certainly could not

1318
00:48:28,790 --> 00:48:26,800
stop you nothing could stop you but

1319
00:48:30,870 --> 00:48:28,800
there is no need to stop you because you

1320
00:48:33,030 --> 00:48:30,880
couldn't even start as gurtha very

1321
00:48:34,390 --> 00:48:33,040
beautifully expressed it in trying to

1322
00:48:37,030 --> 00:48:34,400
oppose nature

1323
00:48:39,270 --> 00:48:37,040
we are in the very process of doing so

1324
00:48:40,630 --> 00:48:39,280
acting in accordance with the laws of

1325
00:48:42,630 --> 00:48:40,640
nature

1326
00:48:44,870 --> 00:48:42,640
don't you see that the so-called laws of

1327
00:48:47,349 --> 00:48:44,880
nature are nothing more than a

1328
00:48:50,390 --> 00:48:47,359
description of how you and other beings

1329
00:48:53,109 --> 00:48:50,400
do act they are merely a description of

1330
00:48:56,390 --> 00:48:53,119
how you act not a prescription of how

1331
00:48:59,270 --> 00:48:56,400
you should act not a power or a force

1332
00:49:01,670 --> 00:48:59,280
which compels or determines your acts to

1333
00:49:04,870 --> 00:49:01,680
be valid allah of nature must take into

1334
00:49:07,750 --> 00:49:04,880
account how you in fact do act or if you

1335
00:49:10,309 --> 00:49:07,760
like how you choose to act

1336
00:49:11,589 --> 00:49:10,319
man so you really claim that i am

1337
00:49:13,430 --> 00:49:11,599
incapable

1338
00:49:15,750 --> 00:49:13,440

of determining to act against natural

1339
00:49:17,670 --> 00:49:15,760
law god

1340
00:49:20,390 --> 00:49:17,680
it is interesting that you have twice

1341
00:49:22,390 --> 00:49:20,400
now used the phrase determined to act

1342
00:49:24,790 --> 00:49:22,400
and chosen to act

1343
00:49:27,030 --> 00:49:24,800
this identification is quite common one

1344
00:49:28,710 --> 00:49:27,040
often uses the statement i am determined

1345
00:49:31,349 --> 00:49:28,720
to do this synonymously with the

1346
00:49:33,750 --> 00:49:31,359
statement i have chosen to do this this

1347
00:49:36,390 --> 00:49:33,760
very psychological identification should

1348
00:49:39,430 --> 00:49:36,400
reveal that determinism and choice are

1349
00:49:41,270 --> 00:49:39,440
much closer than they may appear

1350
00:49:43,270 --> 00:49:41,280
of course you might as well say that the

1351
00:49:45,990 --> 00:49:43,280
doctrine of free will says that it is

1352
00:49:48,309 --> 00:49:46,000
you who are doing the determining

1353
00:49:50,390 --> 00:49:48,319
whereas the doctrine of determinism

1354
00:49:52,790 --> 00:49:50,400
appears to say that you are determined

1355
00:49:54,790 --> 00:49:52,800
by something apparently outside you but

1356
00:49:57,750 --> 00:49:54,800
this confusion is largely caused by this

1357
00:49:59,430 --> 00:49:57,760
bifurcation of reality into the you and

1358
00:50:01,670 --> 00:49:59,440
to the not you

1359
00:50:04,150 --> 00:50:01,680
really now just where do you leave off

1360
00:50:05,829 --> 00:50:04,160
and the rest of the universe begin or

1361
00:50:07,910 --> 00:50:05,839
equivalently where does the rest of the

1362
00:50:10,150 --> 00:50:07,920
universe leave off and you begin once

1363
00:50:13,349 --> 00:50:10,160

you can see that this so-called you and

1364
00:50:15,270 --> 00:50:13,359
so-called nature is a continuous whole

1365
00:50:17,670 --> 00:50:15,280
then you'll never again be bothered by

1366
00:50:19,829 --> 00:50:17,680
such questions as to whether or not it's

1367
00:50:21,430 --> 00:50:19,839
you controlling nature or nature

1368
00:50:23,829 --> 00:50:21,440
controlling you

1369
00:50:26,309 --> 00:50:23,839
thus the muddle of free will versus

1370
00:50:28,870 --> 00:50:26,319
determinism will vanish if i may use a

1371
00:50:31,109 --> 00:50:28,880
crude analogy imagine two bodies moving

1372
00:50:33,270 --> 00:50:31,119
toward each other by virtue of

1373
00:50:34,950 --> 00:50:33,280
gravitational attraction

1374
00:50:37,270 --> 00:50:34,960
which one is exerting the force on the

1375
00:50:39,270 --> 00:50:37,280
other each body if sentient would say

1376
00:50:41,589 --> 00:50:39,280
that it's the other exerting the force

1377
00:50:44,230 --> 00:50:41,599
but in a way it both is in another way

1378
00:50:46,470 --> 00:50:44,240
it is neither it is best to say that it

1379
00:50:48,230 --> 00:50:46,480
is the configuration of the two which is

1380
00:50:49,510 --> 00:50:48,240
crucial

1381
00:50:51,510 --> 00:50:49,520
man

1382
00:50:53,030 --> 00:50:51,520
you said a short while ago that our

1383
00:50:54,950 --> 00:50:53,040
whole discussion was based on a

1384
00:50:56,309 --> 00:50:54,960
monstrous fallacy

1385
00:50:58,069 --> 00:50:56,319
you still haven't told me what that

1386
00:50:59,829 --> 00:50:58,079
fallacy is

1387
00:51:02,150 --> 00:50:59,839
god

1388
00:51:05,270 --> 00:51:02,160

why the idea that i possibly could have

1389
00:51:07,430 --> 00:51:05,280
created you without free will

1390
00:51:09,349 --> 00:51:07,440
you acted as if this was a genuine

1391
00:51:11,910 --> 00:51:09,359
possibility and wondered why didn't i

1392
00:51:14,790 --> 00:51:11,920
choose it it never occurred to you that

1393
00:51:17,510 --> 00:51:14,800
a sentient being without free will is no

1394
00:51:20,309 --> 00:51:17,520
more conceivable than a physical object

1395
00:51:23,109 --> 00:51:20,319
which exerts no gravitational attraction

1396
00:51:25,109 --> 00:51:23,119
bracket there is incidentally more

1397
00:51:27,589 --> 00:51:25,119
analogy here than you realize between a

1398
00:51:30,230 --> 00:51:27,599
physical object exerting a gravitational

1399
00:51:32,309 --> 00:51:30,240
attraction and a sentient being exerting

1400
00:51:34,549 --> 00:51:32,319
free will close bracket

1401
00:51:37,190 --> 00:51:34,559
can you honestly even imagine a

1402
00:51:39,829 --> 00:51:37,200
conscious being without free will what

1403
00:51:41,829 --> 00:51:39,839
on earth could that be like i think one

1404
00:51:43,829 --> 00:51:41,839
thing in your life that is so misled you

1405
00:51:44,630 --> 00:51:43,839
is that i've given man the gift of free

1406
00:51:47,430 --> 00:51:44,640
will

1407
00:51:49,030 --> 00:51:47,440
as if i first created man and then as an

1408
00:51:51,190 --> 00:51:49,040
afterthought endowed him with the

1409
00:51:53,109 --> 00:51:51,200
property of free will maybe you think i

1410
00:51:55,270 --> 00:51:53,119
have some paint brush with which i

1411
00:51:58,630 --> 00:51:55,280
dobbed some creatures with free will and

1412
00:52:00,790 --> 00:51:58,640
not others no free will is not an extra

1413
00:52:03,190 --> 00:52:00,800

it is part and parcel of the very

1414
00:52:06,069 --> 00:52:03,200
essence of consciousness

1415
00:52:09,349 --> 00:52:06,079
a conscious being without free will is

1416
00:52:12,150 --> 00:52:09,359
simply a metaphysical absurdity

1417
00:52:13,990 --> 00:52:12,160
man then why did you play along with me

1418
00:52:16,790 --> 00:52:14,000
all this while discussing what i thought

1419
00:52:18,790 --> 00:52:16,800
was a moral problem when as you say my

1420
00:52:20,549 --> 00:52:18,800
basic confusion

1421
00:52:23,109 --> 00:52:20,559
was metaphysical

1422
00:52:26,309 --> 00:52:24,309
because i thought this would be good

1423
00:52:30,069 --> 00:52:26,319
therapy for you

1424
00:52:31,430 --> 00:52:30,079
to get some moral poison out of your

1425
00:52:33,349 --> 00:52:31,440
system

1426
00:52:36,150 --> 00:52:33,359
much of your metaphysical confusion was

1427
00:52:38,470 --> 00:52:36,160
due to faulty moral notions and so the

1428
00:52:41,510 --> 00:52:38,480
latter had to be dealt with first

1429
00:52:43,109 --> 00:52:41,520
and now we must part at least until you

1430
00:52:44,950 --> 00:52:43,119
need me again

1431
00:52:47,190 --> 00:52:44,960
i think our present union will do much

1432
00:52:49,589 --> 00:52:47,200
to sustain you for a long while but do

1433
00:52:51,510 --> 00:52:49,599
remember what i told you about the trees

1434
00:52:53,750 --> 00:52:51,520
of course you don't have to literally

1435
00:52:55,430 --> 00:52:53,760
talk to them if doing so makes you feel

1436
00:52:56,950 --> 00:52:55,440
let's say silly

1437
00:52:59,190 --> 00:52:56,960
but there is much more you can learn

1438
00:53:03,190 --> 00:52:59,200

from them as well as from the rocks and

1439
00:53:04,870 --> 00:53:03,200
the streams and other aspects of nature

1440
00:53:07,750 --> 00:53:04,880
there is nothing like a naturalistic

1441
00:53:11,270 --> 00:53:07,760
orientation to dispel all these morbid

1442
00:53:14,950 --> 00:53:11,280
thoughts of sin and free will and moral

1443
00:53:17,670 --> 00:53:14,960
responsibility at one stage of history

1444
00:53:19,670 --> 00:53:17,680
such notions were actually useful i

1445
00:53:21,910 --> 00:53:19,680
refer to the days when tyrants had

1446
00:53:24,230 --> 00:53:21,920
unlimited power and nothing short of

1447
00:53:25,910 --> 00:53:24,240
fears of hell could possibly restrain

1448
00:53:28,470 --> 00:53:25,920
them

1449
00:53:30,470 --> 00:53:28,480
but man has grown up since then

1450
00:53:32,630 --> 00:53:30,480
and this gruesome way of thinking is no

1451
00:53:34,150 --> 00:53:32,640
longer necessary

1452
00:53:36,150 --> 00:53:34,160
it might be helpful for you to recall

1453
00:53:41,109 --> 00:53:36,160
what i once said through the writings of

1454
00:53:46,230 --> 00:53:43,510
if you want to get the plain truth

1455
00:53:48,950 --> 00:53:46,240
be not concerned with right and wrong

1456
00:53:50,390 --> 00:53:48,960
the conflict between right and wrong

1457
00:53:54,150 --> 00:53:50,400
is the sickness

1458
00:54:01,270 --> 00:53:56,390
i hope you enjoyed this reading of is

1459
00:54:04,549 --> 00:54:02,870
if you'd like to hear more commentary

1460
00:54:06,549 --> 00:54:04,559
like this slash readings more

1461
00:54:08,069 --> 00:54:06,559
conversations like this though i tend to

1462
00:54:09,510 --> 00:54:08,079
have conversations with people rather

1463
00:54:11,150 --> 00:54:09,520

than reading them

1464
00:54:15,670 --> 00:54:11,160
then please do consider going to

1465
00:54:18,150 --> 00:54:15,680
patreon.com slash kurt jaimungle

1466
00:54:19,990 --> 00:54:18,160
it's the patrons as well as the sponsors

1467
00:54:23,349 --> 00:54:20,000
that help me do this

1468
00:54:26,790 --> 00:54:25,109
i wouldn't be able to go in depth with

1469
00:54:28,230 --> 00:54:26,800
people on conv i wouldn't be able to

1470
00:54:30,630 --> 00:54:28,240
speak to people

1471
00:54:33,589 --> 00:54:30,640
in depth at all on let's say loop

1472
00:54:36,630 --> 00:54:33,599
quantum gravity or string theory or

1473
00:54:38,710 --> 00:54:36,640
consciousness or have out five hour six

1474
00:54:41,430 --> 00:54:38,720
hour long conversations with for example

1475
00:54:42,789 --> 00:54:41,440
leo gura if not for your support

1476
00:54:44,549 --> 00:54:42,799
so please

1477
00:54:47,109 --> 00:54:44,559
if you're interested in helping support

1478
00:54:49,990 --> 00:54:47,119
this channel then do go to patreon.com

1479
00:54:52,150 --> 00:54:50,000
slash kirkjamongle in the description

1480
00:54:55,270 --> 00:54:52,160
there's a paypal option for one-time

1481
00:54:57,589 --> 00:54:55,280
donations there's also a crypto address

1482
00:55:03,349 --> 00:54:57,599
thank you for your viewership regardless

1483
00:55:07,589 --> 00:55:05,510
commentary

1484
00:55:09,990 --> 00:55:07,599
the reason why i love raymond smalian is

1485
00:55:11,670 --> 00:55:10,000
this is such a playful conversation and

1486
00:55:13,190 --> 00:55:11,680
to me it captures plenty of the

1487
00:55:14,710 --> 00:55:13,200
unconscious thoughts that we have or

1488
00:55:16,710 --> 00:55:14,720

perhaps even conscious that we've never